Climate change (un)certainty
The green for the environment metonymy in UK national newspapers

Anaïs Augé
University of East Anglia

Abstract Climate change is a contested issue that has given rise to an opposition between scientific and sceptical arguments. The emergent danger of global warming has instigated a change in society. Environmentally-friendly products have been advertised as solutions to fight global warming and policies have been put in place to avoid any more damage. The green for the environment metonymy has been used as an umbrella term to refer to these solutions. This linguistic trend has resulted in the conceptual metaphor green as good for the planet. However, the conventional use of this metonymy has led to unethical accommodations that possibly promote the rise of scepticism. The awareness that green entities may negatively affect the planet has gradually altered the meaning of the term as it is used in texts about climate change. An analysis of newspaper articles (The Guardian, The Telegraph, Daily Mail, Mirror, The Independent, The Times, The Express) dealing with the issue, as well as a comparison with data from an electronic corpus (British National Corpus, BNC) show how this variation in meaning has occurred. Attention paid to the context helps identify emerging conceptual metaphors that describe different levels of scepticism. By examining negatively evaluated key terms, this analysis thus distinguishes contrasting interpretations that have led to linguistic occurrences of the conceptual metaphor green as bad for the planet that appear through the association with the green for the environment metonymy.

1 Introduction

This paper aims at establishing alternative interpretations of the metonymy green for the environment in climate change newspaper articles. The inclusion of the metonymy in environmental discourses produces an ideological background: it economically represents the causes that environmentalists (e.g. Greenpeace) fight for. This association allows positive connotations to play a role in its interpretation. However, climate change is a highly contested type of environmental discourse. Hence, the following analysis aims at establishing how the use of the metonymy green for the environment has been...
adapted to fit with specific opinions on the topic. Its collocation with words such as \textit{economy}, \textit{taxes} and \textit{rhetoric} generates a metaphorical understanding that extends the number of connotations associated with the term \textit{green}. In Section 2, I will describe the relation between metonymy and metaphor with a focus on existing findings about climate change discourses. In Section 3, the particularities of the corpora under study will be defined and I will explain the approach adopted. In Section 4, I will establish how the \textit{green} political ideology is represented in UK newspaper articles depending on the context. In the final section, alternative interpretations of \textit{green} will be described and I will investigate the linguistic means by which they are related or opposed to each other.

2 Metaphorical and metonymical interpretations in climate change discourses

The distinction between a metaphor and a metonymy can be determined with attention to the number of conceptual domains each involves. First, a metaphor involves a mapping between two domains: the target domain, which represents the topic under discussion, and the source domain, which is a concept that is used by the producer to convey a particular perspective on the topic (Lakoff and Johnson 2002: 5; Deignan 2005: 14; Semino 2008: 5; Kövecses 2010: 4). Contrarily, a metonymy only involves a single domain: a property of the domain is extracted in order to present the whole domain under a certain perspective (Goossens 2002: 351; Lakoff and Johnson 2002: 35; Deignan 2005: 55; Semino 2008: 20; Kövecses 2010: 184; Littlemore 2015: 1).

For example, in environmental discourses, \textit{green} is mentioned as a property that is commonly shared by the elements that are constitutive of the concept of environment (e.g. the colour of leaves, grass and plants). Even if the elements do not share this property (e.g. wood), the producer uses the metonymy to economically refer to the target (i.e. the environment) because it is salient in common knowledge or in the context of use. Metaphors underlie a similar mapping process to metonymy but transcend the domain boundary: the target is described according to the typical properties of the source (Gibbs 1994: 33; Lakoff and Johnson 2002: 52; Kövecses 2010: 176). This allows properties to be selected according to particular perspectives (Lakoff and Johnson 2002: 157; Charteris-Black 2004: 29; Deignan 2005: 23; Goatly 2007: 30; Kövecses 2010: 92-94; Musolff 2016: 8). This meaningful selection of properties may support the elaboration or extension of the metaphor in order to convey a specific view on the topic. For example, Musolff (2016) analyses metaphor scenarios that allow the producer to adapt a metaphor (e.g. \textit{BRITAIN AT THE HEART OF EUROPE}, Musolff 2016: 39-53). This is possible due to a metaphorical script that involves positively or negatively evaluated elements which are then mapped to the constitutive elements of the target to convey a particular perspective (Musolff 2016: 8).
Climate change (un)certainty

30-31).

The interaction between metonymy and metaphor has been discussed by Goossens (2002: 369) who notes that a metaphor can be derived from a metonymy and vice versa. For example, the phrase ‘to catch someone’s ear’ has both metaphorical and metonymical interpretations, namely of an entity trying to get hold of someone’s ear, and of someone’s ear being one of the ways by which attention can be paid, respectively (Goossens 2002: 365). In the corpus of UK newspapers under study, the interaction between metaphor and metonymy takes place when the metonymy green for the environment is used to convey a particular perspective on climate change. The variation of meaning observed in the articles will establish underlying conceptual metaphors which can sometimes be extended to highlight a particular journalistic bias.

Metaphors in climate change discourses play an important role in guiding people’s perceptions on the topic. Indeed, climate change is a complex phenomenon that is not always directly experienced by the people, and thus cannot be represented concretely (Poortinga, Pidgeon, and Lorenzoni 2006: 5; Koteyko, Thelwall, and Nerlich 2009: 23; Nerlich, Koteyko, and Brown 2010). Hence, text producers rely on metaphors to present the issue and to provide an ideologically biased description that underlies a problem of understanding and/or a particular perspective on the topic. For example, Atanasova and Koteyko (2017: 457-461) notice the frequent use of war metaphors in The Guardian to illustrate the urgent need for actions to stop climate change, while the frequent use of religion metaphors in Mail conveys a sceptical interpretation of the phenomenon. Such a diversity of opinion can also be translated by the choice of a specific frame: according to Entmam (1993: 52), “to frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text”. Nerlich and Koteyko (2010: 45, 48) analyse the metaphors associated with climate change when the issue is financially framed. They make a distinction between the ‘carbon goldrush’ frame that adopts an unethical perspective on the economical profits related to the topic, and the ‘carbon cowboy’ frame that criticises this perspective.

The relation between metaphors and frames is relevant for the following analysis. On the one hand, from a general point of view, all the articles in the corpus are framed in relation to climate change: green is used to metonymically represent the environment but, in the corpus, the environment is framed according to the impact of climate change that affects the quality of the environment. On the other hand, the analysis of the collocations of the word green further specifies which aspect of the topic is discussed (e.g. green economy). The identification of the salient aspects of climate change thus helps the interpretation of the metonymy and highlights the relevant properties that underlie the related conceptual metaphors.
3 Corpus building and analysis

The research started with the identification of frequent collocations of the word *green* in an electronic corpus, the British National Corpus, accessed via SketchEngine (Kilgarriff 2003). This first step gave an overview of the different meanings of *green* in a wide variety of contexts. The function WordSketch classified the collocates according to their functions and locations in the sentences (e.g. *bright* is listed as a modifier of *green*) allowing for a first sorting of the metaphorical and literal uses of the word (e.g. it has been assumed that collocates such as *dark* or *yellow* indicate a literal use of the search term). When the collocates were likely to indicate a metaphorical understanding (e.g. *green fee*, *too green*), the sentences in which they occurred were analysed in order to get an approximate understanding of the metaphorical meaning.

Overall, the findings showed that *green* frequently has positive connotations:

(1) It was a tranquil picture the green field; the far woods; above a blue sky dappled with little fleecy clouds. (BNC J54 2429)
(2) ‘No prospect of the green shoots of economic recovery’, said Christopher Sinclair-Stevenson. (BNC H46 1318)

In (1), the presence of words such as *tranquil* and *recovery* indicates that the *field* and *shoots* being *green* is something that is expected by the producer. The meaning is literal: *green* is one of the characteristics of the concept *field* and this characteristic is positively apprehended as the rest of the sentence shows. In (2), the interpretation is metaphorical: the domain of environment is mapped to the domain of economy. The producer wishes the economy had the ability of natural elements to grow again after a period of unsuitable growth.

However, *green* is sometimes found in sentences with negative overtones, especially when the collocate denotes a concrete, visible concept that only receives the property *green* under very specific circumstances:

(3) Continuing to stand with his back to her, he stared silently down at the muddy green waters of the river Thames, for some moments, before turning slowly around to face her. (BNC JXX 354)
(4) ‘Well, he doubled up and went quite green. I’ve never seen that happen before. I thought it was just something people said, but he actually went green and I thought he was going to be sick.’ (BNC HW8 1612-1614)

In (3) and (4), the colour *green* is attributed to the related concepts because of one of their respective properties: *muddy* and *sick*. In both cases, *green* is the visible evidence of a negative internal process within the river or the human body.
As it has been noted, the majority of the analysed sentences convey a positive bias of the word *green*. However, this positive bias (i.e. of the environment showing the characteristics it is supposed to have) seems to have been somehow negatively adapted to metaphorically describe a naïve behaviour:

(5) This owner called Judge, he got hold of me, promised me a motor car, a fur coat and I don’t know what. I was so green I didn’t know what was behind it and boasted that I could become Judge’s Baby when I got back to the dressing room. (BNC B34 1676-1677)

The paradoxical perspective of seeing a concept as good when the concept only exhibits its common characteristics as in (1) (as opposed to unexpected positive characteristics) seems to have been adapted to define a human behaviour (defined in the OED) of ‘naïvety’. Here, the negative human traits of Judge are displayed in the narrated situation, but the producer mistakenly perceives those negative traits in a positive way and this mistake results in a negative interpretation of *green*. Hence, *green* can also be used to describe a concept that is mistakenly conceived as good and that is consequently interpreted as bad. In newspaper articles about climate change, this meaning can be extended to describe a false statement: the negative properties of a concept are voluntarily hidden by the positive connotations of *green* concepts. This point has been acknowledged by Pérez-Sobrino’s (2013) research on ‘greenwashing’ advertising: she establishes that the colour *green* is used to refer to nature and natural products, thus producing the multimodal metaphor *green* FOR NATURE FOR NATURE FRIENDLY (2013: 79-80), while the advertised merchandise (a soda) is originally a contaminant, and thus an unhealthy product (2013: 68-69).

This variation in connotative meanings of *green* has shown the prevalence of a positive bias that can be extended to characterise a negative concept. It can thus be expected that this extension will occur in sceptical articles about climate change. The articles have been selected from Nexis® (accessed 20/05/2018). The research was restricted to the search terms ‘climate change’, ‘global warming’ and ‘green’ in UK national newspapers issued in 2017. This yielded a list of 418 articles that have been downloaded and uploaded to the software AntConc (Anthony 2014). AntConc allows the analyst to focus on a search term from a corpus and to highlight its collocations. The resulting collocations and co-texts were analysed and five main categories of meanings have been established. These categories do not however reflect a strict delimitation, as it is assumed that *green* can be interpreted in various ways depending on the reader and the methodology adopted (see for example the influence of culture on metaphorical understanding in Musolff 2016: 115-131). It will be demonstrated that important nuances appear which seem to be related to each other, either because the target domain is similar (e.g. *green fee*, *green taxes*), or because the meaning has been extended (as in the case of naïve human behaviour).
4 The Green Party and green ideology

The following analysis will focus on the adaptation of the use of the term green depending on the interpretation the journalist wants to convey to the readership. The association between green and politics will then be described and will lead to the study of the gradation of its meaning: this first analysis will show that shifts in meaning can occur when green is used to specify a single domain, politics, depending on the ideology of the Party. The use of a similar metonymy can implicitly describe the variable interest in the environment among political Parties.

The references to the Green Party or political ideology are frequent in climate change articles. As the main interest of the people characterised by the colour green is the environment (metonymically identified), their role in climate change discussions is salient in the selected newspapers (see Nerlich 2010; Shaw and Nerlich 2015). The link between a colour and an ideology is not surprising if attention is paid to the use of red and blue in politics (for example Red and Blue States in the US). However, the use of green shows an interesting pattern: its initial metonymical use, e.g. as in example (2), has shifted towards a representation of the environment as being in need of protection, which has resulted in its conceptual association with an ideology that aims at taking actions in order to preserve it. This shift in meaning can be observed in the selected data:

(6) I’ve been the only Green MP in Parliament for seven years now and I’ve never seen a Government so desperate to look like they care about the environment and animals. (‘Green Gove is Taking the Michael; Cold Homes Expose Tory Tricks’, The People, Caroline Lucas, 31/12/2017)

(7) Janet Rice, the Greens transport spokeswoman, said: "The Turnbull government’s commitment to reducing transport pollution has been woeful so far. For all his selfies on trains, the PM has taken no meaningful action on public transport, zero-carbon electric vehicles, setting strong vehicle efficiency standards, or unchoking our clogged cities". (‘Electricity Target so Weak It Would Require Taking Every Car Away to Meet Paris Deal – Greens; Adam Bandt Says Analysis of Emissions Targets for Electricity Sector Shows the Cost of Caving in to the Climate Deniers’, The Guardian, Michael Slezak, 21/12/2017)

(8) The Guardian View on Green Toryism: It Must Go Beyond Gimmicks; Michael Gove is Pushing a Clutch of Environmental Initiatives But That Alone Will not Remake the Conservatives’ Image. It Does Not Help That Parts of the Party are Steeped in Climate Change Denial. (The Guardian Editorial, 04/12/2017)

(9) Rather than leave it all to Gove, May herself needs to do something big on
Climate change (un)certainty

the green agenda, with which she has never been associated. (‘Conservative Green Policies are Reaching out to Young People but It’s their Stance on Brexit that Really Matters; Some 71% of 18-24 year olds and 54% of 25-49 year olds Voted Remain in the Referendum, According to YouGov’, *The Independent*, Andrew Grice, 29/12/2017)

(10) Government to set up environmental watchdog to deliver ‘green Brexit’.

These examples have been selected because they all deal with ‘green politics’ in different ways. Example (6) shows that *green* can be used to refer to a specific Party as a whole (on account of its own name choice), which is indicated by the capital letter (*Green MP*). Example (7) further specifies the ideology that is retrieved from the use of *green* as a political colour: *Greens* displays the capital letter (as well as the plural form indicating a nominal conversion), and thus refers to the (Australian) political Party. Yet, its use slightly differs from that in (6) because ‘Greens’ is included in a noun phrase in apposition (Janet Rice, the Greens transport spokeswoman). It informs the reader about one of the elements that is targeted by the Party, in this case the reduction of transport pollution. This linguistically shows the evolution from a general ideology towards specific actions.

Example (8) associates the *green* ideology with another political ideology, Toryism. Hence, the use of *green* to refer to a political ideology of its own is subdivided to refer to political ideas that Tories do or do not choose to include within their own ideology. This interpretation can be compared to that in (9) which gathers those ideas into a category of their own (*agenda*). This implies that *green* ideas have become part of various political ideologies and that politicians must include this category (or not) among various other political decisions (i.e. among other categories such as economic and cultural agendas). Example (10) narrows the meaning of *green* even more by transforming the *green* ideology into an aspect of a specific political decision (*Brexit*). Thus, the environmental beliefs and actions are seen as one of the political components that are taken into consideration while dealing with a political decision.

Overall, this discussion has made clear that the use of *green* within the domain of politics has received gradable interpretations depending on the elements involved in the context. When the context includes a member of the Green Party, the concept qualified by *green* is broadened as a whole ideology, whereas when the context refers to something or someone that is not directly associated with this ideology, the use of *green* is narrowed to specify political ideas or an aspect of political ideas. This observation may not look surprising but it illustrates the way that the interpretation of *green* can vary even if its collocates belong to the same domain (in this case, of politics).
5 Green beliefs and green scepticism in climate change discussions

It has been shown that political ideas can provoke variations of the interpretation of green. The following analysis aims at researching similar variations within the broader context of climate change. This phenomenon has produced very different opinions that are likely to be translated in newspapers. Indeed, journalists may favour a specific point of view on the topic following the ideological stance of the editors. In the discussion of relevant examples, I will show that the meaning of green varies from a positive to a negative evaluation of the ideology associated with it. Additionally, its implication in climate change discussions shows relevant differences of opinions.

5.1 The positive depiction of green concepts

In this section, we will see that the green label attributed to a variety of concepts establishes a hierarchy that places those concepts in a superior position vis-à-vis ‘non-green’ concepts. This depiction relies on the prevalent positive view of green as it is translated in the examples retrieved from SketchEngine. This may be explained by the fact that green concepts are seen as a solution against climate change, often giving rise to war metaphors, such as green concepts as a weapon or climate change as an enemy:

(11) Conservationists may preach about the importance of going green to save the planet, but most have a carbon footprint that is virtually no different to anyone else, a study has shown. (‘Conservationists are left red-faced as their green credentials fail to add up’, The Daily Telegraph, Sarah Knapton, 11/10/2017)

(12) Energy companies are under huge pressure from the Government to use more power from cleaner, greener sources to combat climate change. (‘So How Much Do Green Taxes Add To Your Energy Bills?’, Daily Mail, Sara Smyth, 29/11/2017)

(13) Cricket-star turned politician Imran Khan, who heads the political party Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), launched the green mission in Khyber Pakhtunkhaw in the north-west of the country. (‘Pakistani Province Plants One Billion Trees To Help Slow Down Effects Of Global Warming; Cricket-Star Turned Politician Imran Khan Launched The Green Initiative In Khyber Pakhtunkhawaii after Vast Areas Ravaged By Floods And Widespread Felling’, The Independent, Jeff Farrell, 14/08/2017)

(14) Trump gets a load of hot air: Leonardo DiCaprio and thousands of green warriors brave 90F heat to march in DC and across America on the president’s
In (11), *green* does not label a specific concept (*going green*): this use can be compared to the label *Green Party* which means that the *green* elements as a whole have the quality required to *save the planet*. This example focuses on human responsibility in the development of climate change. There is an implicit criticism on the people who did or do not pay attention to *green* solutions (i.e. the absence of *green* solutions has increased climate change) but this blame is counterbalanced by the depiction of human behaviour as a way to solve the problem. Hence, this paradoxical view can be translated by two subtypes of metaphor: HUMANS AS THE AGGRESSORS and HUMANS AS THE SAVIOURS (OF THE PLANET). The ideological bias in examples (12)-(14) now becomes more visible: the reference to a *combat* with *green sources*, *launched green mission* and *green warriors* all imply that the humans involved in these examples are taking a kind of defensive position. Climate change is visualised as an *attack* against the population, but the authors of the *attack* are not mentioned. The focus is put on the *green solutions*, probably to respond to an urgent need for actions, omitting the reasons why the phenomenon has occurred.

The anthropogenic cause of global warming is sometimes taken into account by the journalists. However, a variation of meaning can also be observed as the responsibility is divided between *green* and non-*green* human actions:

(15) **Vampire Strikes Green Banks** (*Daily Mail*, Alex Brummer, 10/01/2017)
(16) **China Builds World’s Biggest Solar Farm in Journey to Become Green Superpower**: Vast plant in Qinghai province is part of China’s determination to transform itself from climate change villain to a green energy colossus (*The Guardian*, Tom Phillips, 19/01/2017)

In (15) and (16), the responsibility is specifically directed towards entities that are characterised by their ‘non-*green*’ actions. As both entities (*Bank* and *China*) imply human actions, the references to those negative actions produced by humans lead to the metaphor HUMAN ACTION AS AN ATTACK (ON THE PLANET). This metaphor is further specified by the metaphor NON-GREEN HUMAN ACTION AS AN ATTACK. Thus, the point of view does not take into account the emergence of climate change, but rather focuses on the evolution of the phenomenon. In (15), the term **Vampire** refers to Macquarie Bank which aims at buying UK’s Green Investment Bank. It implies that the bank that is referred to as a **Vampire** has no *green* label (compared to *Green Banks*) and this consequently suggests the absence of a *green* ideology. It follows that the purchase of a *green* entity by a ‘non-*green*’ entity deletes the *green* label associated with the former, and thus depicts the suppression of beliefs and actions undertaken within this *green entity* (it should be noted that both entities metonymically involve human beings and, more precisely, bankers). Hence, a new perspective on climate change is presented: the victim is not the planet, but rather the
green entity which is put in place to save the planet (GREEN BANK AS VICTIM).

Example (16) presents a similar perspective: China’s past ‘non-green’ decisions are summarised by the phrase climate change villain, which means that this country could be described as the (former) ENEMY/AGGRESSOR in the WAR against climate change. The opposition between climate change villain and green energy colossus establishes the green label as the quality required to be one of ‘the good characters’ of the narrative. Hence, this example does not mention the planet/humans as the victim(s) but focuses on the WAR between ‘green good’ and ‘non-green evil’. It implies that the label green is seen as a necessity for humans/countries even if the reasons for its creation and adoption are not mentioned. Indeed, it can be assumed that if the villain becomes green then there are no enemies left to fight and climate change remains an ATTACK without any AGGRESSOR to be identified.

This positive bias which sees the green label as a necessary condition to be one of ‘the good characters’ can be further explicated with examples showing the association between green and good behaviour:

(17) PolitiFact asked the White House just last month to substantiate Trump’s occasional campaign-season claim about winning green accolades. (‘Trump brags to G7 leaders about green awards he won - in 2007 - as he insists: ‘The environment is very, very important to me, Donald Trump’ (but don’t ask what the prizes were for!), Mail Online, David Martosko, 26/05/2017)

(18) David Cameron promised the “greenest government ever” when he came to office in 2010 and the Coalition made a bright start. (‘Hurricane Irma shows that the Government can’t afford to neglect climate change any longer; Not so long ago, the UK was at the forefront of international efforts to combat climate change, promoting the use of green energy and encouraging other nations to help reduce global carbon emissions. Yet for the last five years, matters have regressed’, The Independent, Editorial, 08/09/2017)

(19) Theresa May mocked for trying to rebrand the Tories as the ‘caring party’; The Conservatives are looking to ditch Cameron’s green tree and emphasise Mrs May’s agenda as part of the image overhaul (Mirror, Nicola Bartlett, 30/11/2017)

The green label becomes an identifying feature of the good characters of the narrative. In (17), the journalist insists on the presence of this identifying feature in President Donald Trump’s decision makings. His belonging to the Republican Party (that is, a Party that does not usually focus on the environment) may indeed raise questions about the part he plays in the narrative. The terms green accolades and green awards (in the title of the article) implicitly involve other politicians who are described as representatives
of ‘the good characters’. This interpretation derives from the specification of *accolades* and *awards*: both terms imply friendly relations between politicians, but these relations only hold because of their *green* quality. Hence, this example aims at describing the US President as being one of the ‘good characters’ because of his *green* decisions.

The wish to associate a politician with the *green* ideology can be further explained with the analysis of (18). In this example, the *green* label is depicted as the government’s trademark. The *green* quality of its policies is a promise made to the people who elected David Cameron as the UK’s Prime Minister. It means that *green* decisions are desirable and are assumed to be part of the well-being of the country. The use of the superlative *greenest* indicates that the possible negative side of ‘going *green*’ is not taken into account. *Green* policies are thus advertised as being inherently good for the people without mentioning any possible negative opinions (because negative opinions are not even conceivable). However, such negative opinions are discussed in (19). The notion *green tree* conveys paradoxical perspectives: on the one hand, there is a positive bias that sees the *tree* as an outcome of David Cameron’s political decisions. The former UK Prime Minister has allowed his *green* ideas to grow into a *tree* (i.e. it possibly yields fruits to nourish the British people). He has thus created something good for his country. On the other hand, the metaphor of the *green tree* can also imply that his decisions are not solid enough to resist the Tories (*ditch*). Indeed, if this example is compared with that of (18), the ‘good’ quality of these decisions is in fact questionable because negative opinions emerge from the existence of this *tree*. It means that *green* politics is no longer conceived of as inherently good but rather as something bad for the Tory Party image.

As noted in Section 4, *green* political decisions are divided between good and bad solutions, and this division questions the conceptual association between *green* and good concepts. This point gives rise to sentences like:

(20) *Shell has seen the future—and it’s several shades of green.*  (*The Sunday Telegraph,* Ben Marlow, 15/10/2017)

(21) *How green are electric cars? [Norway’s lead on electric cars has been driven by the government backing them with a wide range of generous incentives and perks, as a way of meeting its climate change ambitions. Buyers do not pay import tax and VAT on plug-in cars, shaving thousands of pounds off the upfront cost…] ‘Norway leads way on electric cars: ‘it’s part of a green taxation shift’; Nearly a third of all new cars sold in the country this year will be plug-in models and experts expect that share to skyrocket’, *The Guardian,* Adam Vaughan, 25/12/2017)

Examples (20) and (21) present a gradation of the *green* quality of the *future* and of *electric cars*. In (20), some periods or areas are more or less *green* than others. It means that
the *green* label is assigned to a range of concepts even if some of those concepts are not intrinsically good for the planet (potentially *light green* concepts). Similarly, the *green* quality of electric cars is questioned in (21): the journalist wonders whether electric cars really have the potential to save the environment, that is, if they can be *green* enough to be considered *weapons* against climate change or as a kind of Trojan Horse that hides potential bad (or ‘villainous’) qualities. The good reputation of *green* concepts is thus tempered: the initial appealing impact on the population has turned into an advertising strategy (like in (18) and (21)) which has raised questions about the advertisers’ goals (of saving the environment or of making profits).

5.2 The *green* ideology as a naïve behaviour

As noted in Section 3, the prevalent positive bias associated with *green* concepts can give rise to a negative judgement on their appealing quality. As in the case of the advertisement analysed by Pérez-Sobrino (2013), the *green* label presenting the concept as being good for the environment (or as a *weapon* that helps ‘fight’ climate change) can be misused in order to fit the societal trend. Several articles from the corpus imply that the *green* label helps the conceptualisation of a *greener*, better future, but the *shades of green* mentioned above indicate that some *green* concepts may not do enough to save the planet despite their reputation. This general belief that can be summarised by the metaphor *GREEN AS GOOD* (FOR THE PLANET) is thus sometimes depicted as a form of naïvety:

(22) Enough of the gullible greens – they’ve led us into a peasouper [(...)Bravo! A policy designed to meet our international climate change obligations has led to a rise in pollution levels that are so foul and dangerous to health that the Tories may soon make us scrap our vehicles or we’ll face surcharges for using them.] (The Sunday Times, Sarah Baxter, 05/02/2017)

(23) Like many duped motorists, I acquired my diesel car in the naïve belief that it would not only be more efficient and cost-effective than a petrol one, but also that it was better for the environment. We now know that this green myth is a nonsense. (‘Forget Suing VW. We Should All Be Claiming Millions For Other ‘Green’ Lunacies that Literally Cost the Earth’, Daily Mail, James Delingpole, 10/01/2017)

Examples (22) and (23) illustrate a loss of faith in the *green* label. They both indicate negative side effects following the overwhelming descriptions of *green* concepts as being inherently good for the population. Here, the adoption of *green* political ideas (22) and the purchase of a greener car (23) have been caused by the naïve belief that *green* concepts do not have any negative aspects (following the implications established in (18)). However, the progressive discovery of *green*-related problems (here, economic problems)
have produced a denial of the *green* ideology. Instead of being depicted as ‘good for the environment’, *green* concepts are associated with the problems that emerge from their appealing image.

This interpretation can be contrasted with the description of the principal *green*-minded actors advertising this ideology. Indeed, the negative side of *green* concepts has produced a loss of hope for a *greener* future because of the resulting lack of (economic) sustainability.

(24) An academic has predicted how some of the most well-known and beloved cities on earth will look like in a future green utopia. (‘What will London and LA look like in 2121? Environmental scientist illustrates the future of world’s biggest cities; Alan Marshall imagined the future of our cities - and they mostly look green’, *The Independent*, Olivia Blair, 19/01/2017)

(25) ‘But that’s what happens when policy is driven by wishful thinking and green religion.’ (‘Tony Abbott will vote against any ‘unconscionable’ clean energy target from the government – as he demands green subsidies be DUMPED so companies build coal power plants’, *Mail Online*, News Section Version 4, 19/09/2017)

(26) The do-gooding rich make us pay for their green follies. (*The Sunday Times*, Editorial, 29/10/2017)

These three examples illustrate a gradation of faith in a *green* ‘ideal’ future. In (24), the term *utopia* indicates that *green* is still associated with positive connotations, but that these connotations are contrasted with problems of the real world that prevent this ideal picture from becoming true. By contrast, in (25), the term *religion* implies that this *green* future is not inherently ideal. While (24) depicts *green* ideals as desirable (but impossible), (25) takes into consideration the people who may not wish for this kind of future. The religion metaphor also indicates that the *green* decisions put in place by politicians do not fit the real world, just like religion describes an alternative reality with the manifestation of uncommon events. Hence, these *green* decisions are taken in the hope of seeing uncommon events (e.g. the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions) that seem to belong to a different reality.

This point is emphasized in (26) which focuses on the gap between the *green* ideology and reality. The term *follies* refers to the absence of commonalities between *green* thinking and the real world. *Green* concepts are not appealing anymore: *green* is used to describe a future that will never exist and *green* decisions are described as unrelated to the common world, making the actors of climate change (or *the do-gooding rich*) look like they are believing in an absurd reality. Hence, the scepticism that emerges from these examples can be explained with the prevalent good connotations of *green* discussed above associated
with real world events that are far from ideal (such as extreme weather events).

The absence of an aggressor illustrated by examples (12)-(14) and (17) may have led to the absence of any attack (i.e. climate change) which means that the search for solutions is meaningless for some journalists. It can also be seen as a kind of resignation after the repeated occurrences of dramatic events. However, it should be noted that none of the three examples mentioned above discusses the participants’ beliefs. They are depicted as idealists, religious or crazy but the importance they give to green decisions is not perceived as a form of public manipulation.

5.3 Green ideals used to cover the truth

The good reputation of green concepts has been demonstrated and evidence has been found in both corpora (the BNC and UK newspaper articles). Some journalists have acknowledged the accommodation of green concepts by politicians to make their decisions more appealing to the public, relying on the conceptual metaphors green is good therefore green X is good. This point can be compared to Pérez-Sobrino’s (2013) findings on the ‘greening’ of a non-green product.

In the corpus, this persuasive use of the green for the environment metonymy takes place at different levels. In some articles, green concepts are not described as inherently appealing, and journalists implicitly blame politicians for advertising these concepts by highlighting their positive features and hiding the negative ones (as mentioned in Section 5.2).

(27) Tories are putting beauty into green policy; More than a decade since it was first inspired, the party has refound its environmental edge. (The Daily Telegraph, Laura Sandys, 12/12/2017)

In (27), the good reputation of green concepts is paralleled with the Tories’ concerns for the environment (see (8)). Considering the conceptual metaphor green as good, the Tories have had to adapt their policies in order to avoid any conceptual analogy such as the Tories as the aggressors (of the planet). It means that dealing with green concepts has become a requisite of political communications (see Sections 4 and 5.1) and the Tories have had to highlight the green features that fit their policies: green policy is an unattractive concept that is presented with its ‘beautiful’ features by the Tories. It follows that, according to the journalist, these ‘beautiful’ features are used for persuasive purposes so that people may adopt an unattractive green ideology.

This point can be further elaborated by the following examples. The association between green concepts and different political decisions has been understood by some journalists as a way of downplaying other issues.
(28) These green talks, which are fundamentally about ethical concerns, are nevertheless becoming more like discussions about trade. (‘The Guardian view on climate talks: Brexit’s heavy weather; If Brexit goes ahead, Britain will need to shape a green politics with devolution and social justice at its core. And make sure that politicians cannot renege on our international obligations’, The Guardian, Editorial, 17/11/2017)

(29) Green policies may impress the young, but it’s the Tory stance on Brexit that matters. (The Independent, Andrew Grice, 30/12/2017)

(30) No more green rhetoric. A sustainable future is vital and possible; Climate change is at the heart of Labour’s industrial strategy, which means investing in green tech and renewable energy, and divesting from fossil fuels. (The Guardian, Rebecca Long-Bailey, 11/12/2017)

Example (28) establishes a link between green decisions and economics. The association might be justified in terms of the financial outcomes of green policies already mentioned with regard to (23). In this case, the journalist implies that the green label is no longer used to deal with the protection of the environment (ethical concerns) but rather with economic consequences. It means that a shift of meaning has occurred: environmental decisions involve a long-term process and politicians may focus on immediate solutions that the public can understand because of their well-delineated reality (trade).

In (29), green is rather used as an argument to persuade a part of the population. Green policies are contrasted with opinions on Brexit, which means that the appealing quality of green concepts is used by the Tories to avoid a contentious topic that is presented as having less positive connotations than green decisions. It also shows that the green negative features mentioned previously are not taken into consideration; the label is only used for its good reputation. Example (30) demonstrates a different pattern: politicians’ uses of green positive connotations are described as a form of lie. Green rhetoric seems to prevent any change as it is opposed to green actions. Hence, the meaning of green is divided between the reasons why the environment needs protection (rhetoric) and the means put in place to protect it (green tech). Politicians aim to convince people that green is good but do not mention what it takes to live in a green world. Indeed, establishing green policies may highlight the negative side (e.g. the economy) of good policy aspects (such as green tech), and thus may produce disagreement among the population.

Occasionally, journalists clearly associate green with dishonesty:

(31) Electric cars are NOT as green as you think (and some are worse polluters than petrol!) GUY WALTERS provides a reality check about the vehicles (Mail Online, Guy Walters, 10/11/2017)

Here, green concepts are seen through the spectrum of economic profits. The prevalent
positive view on *green* concepts has led to the labelling of other elements that are in fact not environmentally friendly. Therefore, the implications identified in the use of the word *green* (i.e. concerns for environmental protection) are explicitly opposed to the observations of interfering qualities (pollution). In this example, the conceptual metaphor *green as good* still prevails, but the metaphor *green cars as good* does not hold, which leads to the conceptualisation of *green cars as bad* (for the planet). Hence, the concepts that were supposed to be used as a ‘defence’ against climate change are here described as an attack on the planet. The difference that emerges is that the aggressor is not the phenomenon itself, but rather the advertisers who misuse the *green* label.

### 5.4 The negative description of *green* concepts

The acknowledgement of the misleading use of the *green* label has led to a new adaptation of meaning that defines pretence of *green* commitments as bad for the planet. The evolution of *green* advertising and marketing has added a new perspective on actions taken against climate change. The lack of ethics (making a profit from a global problem) and the increasing feeling of urgency to solve the problem (e.g. the use of apocalyptic rhetoric as analysed in Foust and Murphy 2009) has created a paradox that has contributed to the emergence of scepticism. It can be inferred that the climate change references in advertisements or political rhetoric have transformed the problem into a marketing or persuasive strategy which has promoted global warming denial.

(32) Bennett, of Friends of the Earth, said Gove was not the first politician to be affected by the role of environment secretary, pointing to former Tory MP John Gummer, whose work while in the cabinet had him branded a “green guru” by one newspaper. He said the same had happened with David Miliband. (‘Michael Gove: from ‘shy green’ to ‘full-throated environmentalist’: Many feared what the MP would do when he became environment secretary this year - but he has pleasantly surprised his critics’, *The Guardian*, Anushka Asthana, 12/11/2017)

(33) So vote Blue Planet, not Gove Green! (‘Tory green policy is made of plastic; SM1...he still packs a punch’, *Daily Mirror*, John Prescott, 17/12/2017)

Example (32) illustrates the re-adaptation of *green* talks to criticize this trend. It should be noted that the word *guru* can either qualify the head of a religious sect or an influential teacher.\(^1\) In this example, the assimilation of Tory MP John Grummer as a *green guru* is said to have affected him. Hence, his influence on people has not been perceived positively. People’s beliefs in a better future are accommodated for mischievous purposes. The sceptic perspective of the newspaper mentioned in the example (by one newspaper) may relate to

---

\(^1\)Oxford English Dictionary Online, accessed 27/05/2018.
the widespread use of the *green* label discussed above: the enactment of *green* policies by a Party which does not adopt the *green* ideology as a whole (like in the case of the *Green* Party discussed in Section 4) may have been perceived as a dishonest interest.

This point is further elaborated in (33) which contrasts *green* policies with effective solutions to save the planet. The phrase *Blue Planet* refers to a documentary directed by Sir David Attenborough, as explained in the article. The example implies that the meaning of *green* has been adapted to refer to political talks that do not really aim at finding solutions to climate change. It means that the *green* label is only used for its positive connotations but does not refer to existing beliefs in a better future. In other words, the author of the article, the politician John Prescott, considers competing strategies to save the environment: on the one hand, politicians advertise *green* solutions to convince people (to vote for them), and on the other hand, environmentalists wish for rapid solutions that differ from political proposals.

This perspective sometimes leads to a radical denial of the positive connotations of the *green* label:

(34) The Prime Minister has ordered a renewed focus on animal welfare and the environment four years after her predecessor, David Cameron, told his ministers to ditch “the green crap”. (*’Tories bid to rebuild green credentials with raft of animal welfare measures’, *The Independent*, Nigel Morris, 13/12/2017)

(35) This Green and Poisoned Land (*Mail on Sunday*, 21/05/2017)

In both (34) and (35), *green* is associated with highly negative terms, namely *crap* and *poisoned*. The latter creates a kind of oxymoron if *green* is interpreted according to the conceptual metaphor *GREEN IS GOOD (FOR THE PLANET)*. Hence, instead of saving the planet (and thus, the population), *green* concepts are depicted as a danger: *green* concepts are no longer WEAPONS AGAINST CLIMATE CHANGE but rather WEAPONS AGAINST THE PLANET. This paradox is even more apparent with the underlying reference to the last verse of William Blake’s poem: *In England’s green and pleasant land*.\(^2\) Hence, the association between *green* and *pleasant* (also observed in Section 3) is replaced with the use of a term that involves highly negative connotations (*poisoned*). Indeed, the article deals with the so-called *green guzzler* that was initially created to produce environmentally-friendly electricity but that released toxic slime in Pencen, Wales. It follows that the association between a *green* concept and toxic substances promoted journalistic scepticism. Similarly, the reference to David Cameron’s *green crap* emphasizes the dishonest uses of the word (with reference to past comments or events) and focuses on the absence of solutions that have gradually favoured either resignation or disbelief.

6 Conclusion

It could have been expected that the use of the metonymy \textit{green for the environment} in UK newspaper articles about climate change would yield similar interpretations across different texts. Indeed, that the metonymy is used to refer to the environment and climate change discourse further specifies this reference by depicting an environment in potential danger (e.g. the \textit{Green} Party discussed in Section 4). The uncertainty associated with global warming raises questions about the use of the term \textit{green} in sceptical articles. The overall positive interpretation of the metonymy \textit{green for the environment} has been adapted to the discussions of a contested issue, climate change. The scepticism, sometimes associated with the topic, is expected to have exhibited some interpretative variations of \textit{green}. Hence, attention has been paid to the meaning induced by collocations and co-text, which can lead to metaphorical interpretations of the metonymy, depending on the different perspectives about climate change.

This paper has demonstrated the prevalence of positive implications derived from the use of \textit{green} in the corpus (examples (11)-(21)) as well as in different contexts (in the BNC, examples (1) and (2)). A gradation of meaning has then been established: the positive connotations have been detailed and the different aspects of \textit{green} concepts have been related to more specific interpretations. The examples analysed in this paper have demonstrated the underlying conceptual metaphors that can be derived from the producers’ interpretations of the metonymy. \textit{Green} concepts have been pictured as \textit{weapons} against climate change leading to the qualification of humans as the \textit{victims} of the phenomenon. The reference, in some articles, to non-\textit{green} human activities has counterbalanced this qualification with the depiction of these activities as an \textit{attack} on the planet. It results that the positive connotations can either be used to describe a naïve behaviour (examples (22)-(26)) or to hide an inconvenient truth (examples (27)-(31)). The \textit{green} quality of some concepts has been questioned by journalists: they refer to the appealing reputation of the label as a marketing strategy that makes people believe in a \textit{green utopia} (24). When this meaning is related to politics, journalists challenge the honesty of the Party’s concern for the environment (28). Besides, the \textit{green for the environment} metonymy can occasionally receive negative implications (examples (32)-(35)) with implicit reference to its more general positive use (such as the reference to William Blake’s poem that describes a \textit{green and pleasant land} which has been adapted by the journalist to describe the land as being \textit{poisoned}, (35)).

These findings show the influence that journalistic perspective has on the interpretation of a single metonymy across contexts. The recurrent references to politicians’ stance indicate a connection between politics and \textit{green} concepts that may reveal new implications in a future corpus analysis of political speeches. The comparison between journalistic and
political uses of the GREEN FOR THE ENVIRONMENT metonymy may thus be an interesting topic for further research.

References


**Anaïs Augé** is a PhD candidate in Linguistics at the University of East Anglia. After completing a Master’s degree (Université de Caen Normandie, France) involving two research projects related to the analysis of metaphors in discourse, she now focuses on the comparison of metaphor scenarios across literary genres. Her PhD thesis aims at investigating the variation of meaning of climate change metaphors in British newspapers, British political speeches, scientific articles and press releases from NGOs. Her areas of research are cognitive linguistics, applied linguistics, corpus analysis and historical linguistics.
Translating tweets in the soccer industry
Identity management and visibility in a global game

ROGER BAINES
University of East Anglia

ABSTRACT Migration has created exceptionally diverse professional communities within many professional soccer leagues. These diverse communities then interact with global audiences, yet the key challenge of communication across languages has not previously been the focus of academic attention. This article investigates Twitter translation practice within this highly commercial industry. It reveals tensions between global and local identities as soccer players, soccer clubs, and governing organizations manage identity performance and economic potential across language barriers on social media. The analysis draws on original questionnaire and interview data from the perspective of translation providers and high-level figures in the soccer industry. The findings foster debate about cross-language communication on social media in the soccer industry and extend existing work on social media and translation, in particular with regard to professional practice, fluency and visibility of translation and translators in this unusual professional setting.

1 Introduction

There is now considerable scholarship in English devoted to Twitter in sports contexts. Topics range from assessing the potential of Twitter for fan/club-athlete interaction (e.g. Pegoraro 2010), to differences between Twitter and traditional sports journalism (e.g. Price, Farrington, and Hall 2013) through analysis of how sports stars can use Twitter as a promotional tool (e.g. Hambrieck et al. 2010; Pegoraro and Jinnah 2012) and to build athlete identity (e.g. Sanderson 2013). In a Communication & Sport Twitter research forum essay, Hutchins (2014: 122) acknowledges the pivotal role of social networking platforms in contemporary sport, calls for closer examination of Twitter’s commercial status and a more central focus in future research on commodification.

Tweets composed in a wide range of languages and tweets crossing language barriers create the conditions for tweet translation. Even if English is the most frequent global

*This is an abridged version of an article recently published by https://journals.humankinetics.com/doi/abs/10.1123/ijsc.2018-0141. Thanks to the PiLaCS reviewers for their useful feedback.

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. Copyright is retained by the author.
lingua franca, most of the world’s population does not have first or second language access to English (Eriksen 2014: 62), and most of the Twitter-using population do not compose tweets in English (Bennett 2011; Mocanu et al. 2013). High levels of heterogeneity in the nationalities of athletes, coaches and fans, combined with high-profile media coverage, give professional sports contexts a particularly rich character in tweets that interest audiences in multiple languages. Migrant athletes and coaches, for example, regularly work in contexts where they are not proficient in the host country language(s). They thus publish tweets in their first language (Figure 1):

**Figure 1:** Jesus, G. 2018. Literal translation: Hello, Mother. Great game guys, let’s go with everything!

Or produce non-fluent tweets in the host language (Figure 2):

**Figure 2:** Monreal, N. 2014.

Or tweet in both their first language and the host language to communicate with monolingual and multilingual fans (Figure 3):

**Figure 3:** Gomes, H. 2017.

Multilingual tweeting by athletes and coaches, and monolingual tweeting in a language which is not the principal language of the host country, are supplemented by multilingual tweets from sport clubs, media outlets, and transnational governing bodies.

Considerable research demonstrates the value of sports stars using social media to promote their brand, not least in business research contexts (e.g. Parganas, Anagnostopoulos, and Chadwick 2015; Korzynski and Paniagua 2016) but there are high risks. Social media posts can present a threat to the strength of soccer player or club brands, as in other high-profile sports and businesses. There is a well-developed sensitivity to
Translating tweets in the soccer industry

any media coverage that could damage positive PR narratives, and consequently affect reputation and economic strength. This is reflected in the ways in which soccer clubs and professional organizations educate players about social media use. See, for example: the standard section in players’ codes of conduct relating to social media use, forbidding comments that can be construed as negative (Johnson 2016); social media guidance provided by the players’ union in the UK, the Professional Footballers Association (PFA); and club and governing body fines for inappropriate tweets. Other kinds of corporations exert similar power over social media content; see, for example, Vaast and Kaganer (2013), and the British Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service’s advice on ‘Social media in the workplace’ (Acas 2018). Soccer industry social media education communicates the risk of negative wider media impact to players and clubs. This high sensitivity to the dangers of brand damage is critical to tweet translators’ work in the industry.

Identity and identity performance are crucial to high-profile sports stars and organizations in creating and maintaining brands. Studies of celebrity tweeting (e.g. Marwick and boyd 2011) and sports celebrity tweeting (e.g. Lebel and Danylchuk 2012) give accounts of the identity management that soccer clubs, players, agents, and governing bodies want to practise but which can be jeopardized in translation, or in the composition of tweets in a language in which the player or coach is not proficient. Goffman’s seminal The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life (1959) argues that the performance of the self is a continuous presentation before a certain group of people designed to have an influence on those observers. In contrast to this societal front stage ‘performance’ is the area of the backstage where the individual is no longer pressurized to maintain a public performance (Leary 1995: 87). This theory has been used to explain the appeal of social media for celebrities, including sports stars, because social media provides direct access to the backstage dimensions of their lives without any mediation by traditional media (see Hutchins 2010: 242).

In most cases this ‘backstage’ access afforded by Twitter is an illusion because what is performed is carefully managed identity for self-promotion. Kytölä and Westinen (2015), writing about Finnish soccer player Mikkel Forssell switching on Twitter into a language (or variety) generally not thought to belong to him, argue that there is a re-negotiation by the audience of “the relation between speaker, place and language in seeking to determine who has the right to use which linguistic resources to/with whom and where”. They note that “authenticity and normativity (correctness, appropriateness and expertise) become key issues in these negotiations” (Kytölä and Westinen 2015: 17). Objections by those reading and commenting on Forssell’s use of ‘gangsta’ language on Twitter centered on the inauthenticity of that language in relation to the norms of Forssell’s habitual communication to which readers will have been exposed through other media, including spoken media. Thomas (2014: 253) notes that the intimacy and immediacy of Twitter’s inter-
face “increases the potential for a star’s tweets to be interpreted as an indicator of an authentically ordinary star voice” but a common assumption is that most celebrities do not compose their own tweets. See, for example, Kaufman (2013) and Desjardins (2017: 123) who note that in celebrity contexts disclosure as to who is the actual author of an online social media account is rarely given. Migrant players or coaches and their agents may be invested in appearing authentic through their language use on Twitter to cultivate a strong relationship with fans. This objective will, in most cases, have a commercial dimension (see e.g. Pegoraro and Jinnah 2012).

This investigation underlines the fundamental relationship between brand and the translation of tweets in the market-led soccer industry/culture in line with Hutchins’ (2010) comment that research into Twitter in sports contexts needed to focus more on commodification. For Gilchrist (2005: 126), “The modern sport star [...] is [...] both cultural product (as a brand to be sold) and process (part of the chain of advertising and brand or product endorsement that underpins the regime of capital accumulation”). Soccer stars and clubs, and indeed governing bodies, are commodities which have a brand. Each wants to enhance and protect that brand for commercial reasons. In translation, PR affects the very first decision about the method for translating tweets: human or automatic online translation. Twitter users can click to access an automatic translation provided by Microsoft’s Bing Translator in over 40 languages. This is how most tweets are translated by individual users. However, players, player representatives, clubs and governing bodies usually exercise more care. If a particular tweet is needed in another language they tend to use professional human translators, unless the tweeter is sufficiently fluent to translate/compose a similar tweet (as in Figure 3). This is because PR-conscious professionals wish to avoid the potential brand damage of a poor quality automatically translated tweet.

Examining the translation of tweets in the soccer industry through a Translation Studies lens reveals another common point of contact with identity performance and management which is key to professional translation practice: visibility. Visibility has been a key term in Translation Studies. As noted above, what is visible backstage on Twitter is often stage-managed by high-profile soccer players and their agents. Translation usually becomes visible when a lack of fluency in the target language highlights the fact that a text has been translated (in the same way that a lack of fluency in the host language foregrounds ‘foreignness’). Fluency in the target language is usually a professional objective for a professional translator, a norm which renders the translator and the translation process invisible. Achieving fluency in translation is a strategy which reflects the soccer industry’s commercial objectives. Translations which provide a smooth reading experience are better for reputation and economic standing than translations which are difficult to process or which contain errors or inaccuracies. This is the same commercial imperative
that is applied to the localization of digital products and digital platforms for consumption in diverse linguistic and cultural contexts (see e.g. Schäler 2010). This commercial imperative is also found in the Anglo-American literary publishing industry where translations into English which read fluently and are adapted to the receiving culture’s norms are favoured because they sell better (Venuti 2008: 7).

The fluency norms of professional translation practice described here have, however, been contested on ethical grounds in Translation Studies, in particular by Venuti. A translation strategy which prioritizes fluency in the target context over fidelity to the source text is called a domesticating/acculturating strategy. Venuti, among others, argued that when such a strategy is used the source culture and the translation profession are denied visibility and recognition (see e.g. Bassnett 2005; Desjardins 2017; Venuti 2010). However, such academic concerns are rarely observed in professional practice where fluency has high value, and recognition of the worth of translators and translation generally has low value. A lack of fluency in poor quality translated texts can adversely affect both the reputation and economic standing of the client who commissioned the translation, and the reputation and job security of the translation provider/translator (see Desjardins 2017: 118; Drugan 2013: 189). Consequently, fluency in the translation of tweets in the soccer industry should be the norm. However, in relation to identity performance in the backstage of Twitter misspellings and grammatical errors, which are not usually indicators of fluency, are commonly recognized as a sign of authenticity (Marwick and boyd 2011). This tension between the value of fluency and the value of authenticity, both of which contribute to the development of the economic value of a player or coach’s brand, link up with questions raised above in the context of glocalization, and reflect decisions that translators of tweets and their clients in the soccer industry have to take.

2 Theoretical framework

Commercial objectives reflect the soccer industry’s dominant ethos and permeate translation practice. Although the value of professional translation is by no means generally accepted in the soccer industry, it is nonetheless an industry where, in most contexts, resources could be found to fund translation. It is notable that the majority of the minimal Translation Studies work on social media and translation relates to translation in non-professional contexts, in contexts where funding for translation is not necessarily available (fan translation, crisis management, activism etc.; see Desjardins (2017: 22) for a review of existing work). Desjardins argues that online social media translation does not always coincide with translation for a commercial purpose, as in fan translation, activism etc. The translation of tweets in the soccer industry, however, does entirely coincide with translation for a commercial purpose. This commercial underpinning of translation activity, and
the destabilising effect it has on the control of media managers over clubs’ self-confirming narratives, can also be seen in the translation of press interviews and press conferences in the soccer industry (see Baines 2018).

The management of the brand identity of players, and of clubs, as communicated through Twitter, can also be compromised by translation, and by expression in a foreign language. When thinking about the interplay between the global marketing context of the soccer industry, and local identity as expressed in the use of language, and the translation of that language, glocalization is an important concept.

Debating the way in which globalization became misunderstood as a homogenizing process of cultural imperialism rather than simultaneous and interpenetrative local and global processes, Robertson (2012: 194) puts forward glocalization as a refinement of globalization. For him, glocalization better captures the interweaving of the local and the global:

The idea of glocalization in its business sense is closely related to what in some contexts is called, in more straightforwardly economic terms, ‘micro-marketing’: the tailoring and advertising of goods and services on a global or near-global basis to increasingly differentiated local and particular markets.

This is a sound basis for examining the ways in which glocalization, the tailoring of soccer brands, whether by club, player/coach, or organization, to differentiated markets can be detected in how those managing Twitter accounts deal with translation and non-fluent expression in the host language. Applying the concept of glocalization to sport and the successful reach of major brands in global markets, Giulianotti and Robertson (2007: 34) argue that rather than seeking to neuter cultural difference through a strategic global uniformity, the transnational corporations that major sports teams/franchises now are “have acknowledged that securing a profitable global presence necessitates operating in the languages of the local”. Language is a major characteristic that can mark out or express the local in a particular context, define a context as local or, potentially, in the use of the common global lingua franca of English, be symptomatic of processes which impose cultural homogeneity and sameness. Glocalizing strategies, of course, play out in different ways for different businesses and brands, but the tension and interplay between the local and the global resonates strongly in the framework of global sport brand identity when looking at tweets by migrant soccer players and coaches and their translations/tweets expressed with a lack of fluency in the host language.

3 Research questions

This study aims to develop understanding of digital interactions in contexts of linguistic diversity in professional soccer and provide a platform for more research into the pro-
fessional practice of social media translation in other linguistically diverse sectors of the sports industry, and indeed in other commercial contexts. In the soccer industry, exceptionally diverse professional communities interact with global audiences, yet the challenge of communication across languages has received very little academic attention. Sport and communication scholarship has not hitherto turned the spotlight on this critical area for migrant athletes and coaches, their clubs, associations and fan-bases. Nor has research in sport and migration, or sport and globalization developed in this area. A parallel gap in scholarship exists in relation to social media in translation studies as the sole major study of translation and online social media appeared only in 2017.

RQ1 What does the picture built up by interviewees and questionnaire respondents reveal about translation, identity and processes of glocalization in the soccer industry?

RQ2 What do interview and questionnaire responses reveal about the pressures of brand identity management on translation practices on Twitter in the soccer industry?

RQ3 What do interview and questionnaire responses reveal about fluency and the visibility of the translator/translation process in relation to the translation of tweets in the soccer industry?

4 Method

The data presented here consists of interview and questionnaire responses, and some tweets. The interviews are part of a larger holistic investigation of policy and practice relating to communication across language barriers in the soccer industry in Europe for which three soccer agents, two soccer club media managers, four former migrant soccer players, eight soccer club player liaison/welfare officers, and 10 translator/interpreters have so far been interviewed. Studies of translation and interpreting are often partially limited by the lack of a range of perspectives. The multiple viewpoints represented here provide an unusually rich data resource. They include contextual comments from an agent, a media manager, and two former players. However, the principal data interpreted below comes from comments made about social media translation in a subset of the interviews described above: five semi-structured interviews with professional translators. The translators represented a diverse range of languages and working contexts: of the five translators interviewed, one translated into French from English; the other four translated into English from either French and Italian, French and Spanish, or Spanish and Portuguese. They work for players, coaches, and clubs in the highest leagues: the English Premier League, Serie A in Italy, Ligue Un in France, and La Liga in Spain.

Three of the interviews were conducted in person, two via Skype. Interviews were used because the investigation was concerned with facts, descriptions and opinions recalled
by interviewees about translation in the soccer industry. Semi-structured interviews were used because they provided the flexibility to adapt questions to suit the interviewee and to pursue other questions that emerged in the interaction. The open interview questions about translation and social media were designed to extract descriptions of experience and to home in on issues and challenges the translators had experienced in the translation of tweets in the soccer industry.

Further data was collected via five questionnaires specifically about the translation of tweets which were exchanged via email with four of the professional translators interviewed plus one other who worked for a governing body who became available after the interviews. The questionnaires used open-ended questions building on the material collected in the interviews. The interviews had raised questions about: identity management and the illusion of backstage performance on Twitter through translation; and fluency and translation/translator visibility. These questions were pursued in the questionnaires which focused on the following specific issues (not all of which feature in this article): the illusion of backstage identity; the translation of hashtags; the transfer of technical language in relation to injuries; the translation of taboo language in tweets; time pressure; the use of emojis; and the level of guidance provided by clients, how the quality of the translators’ work was assessed, and working conditions. The interviews were transcribed for analysis. The data in the interview transcription and the questionnaires were then grouped by theme and relevant passages extracted for interpretation under the headings of the research questions. Both the interview and the questionnaire were piloted with the first respondent in each category.\(^1\) A final data set consists of tweets collected from the public domain. These tweets by migrant players and by clubs were identified progressively to illustrate specific points that emerged from the analysis of the interviews and questionnaires.

Goffman’s (1959) work on identity, and identity management and performance, and Venuti’s on the ethics of the translator’s invisibility informed the collection of questionnaire data and were used for thematic qualitative analysis of all the data. However, the thread of enquiry around glocalization did not feature explicitly or implicitly in the interviews and questionnaires, it only emerged once the data was being analyzed which is when Robertson (2012) and Giulianotti and Robertson’s (2007) work was investigated for data analysis.

Gaining research access to members of the soccer industry, especially at the more elite levels, is particularly difficult because of the industry’s heightened wariness around any potential damage to brand and reputation (see e.g. comments by Roderick 2006: 249-250). Consequently, identifying and agreeing interviews with some of the former players, agents, and media managers who provided some of the data relied on a series of contacts provided

\(^1\)Design of the research tools was informed by advice in Hale and Napier’s (2013) Research Methods in Interpreting.
by interviewees and a snowballing method. The translators were less difficult to identify and reach but a similar snowballing method was used to gain access. All questionnaire respondents and interviewees gave permission for the data to be used anonymously. In consultation with the translators who have signed professional non-disclosure agreements with their clients, some examples have been adjusted to further protect anonymity, thus underlining the commercially sensitive character of the contexts in which these translators work.

5 Discussion

The high sensitivity to the dangers of brand damage, and an awareness of the increased risks to reputation when using a foreign language or using translation, are confirmed by the following comments from former migrant players, an English Premier League club media manager, and a soccer players’ agent/representative:

Your credibility could suddenly just go, your words could be taken out of context and that could go viral. (Former player 1, 2017)

There are examples of people, there are so many, players who go just to Google translator [sic] and they will just get the translation and paste it in Twitter, “don’t do that, that’s completely the opposite meaning of what you wrote!”. (Former player 2, 2017)

We have to have complete trust in the people translating...We have people on contracts translating basically all our content into our Twitter feeds across the world but if I’m looking at our Weibo feed or our Twitter feed into Mandarin, I obviously haven’t got a clue. (Media manager, 2015)

We would encourage a foreign player in the early stages to send any draft tweets to us because I am very aware that one erroneous tweet can ruin a career...Commercially the player needs to develop an English following as soon as they can if they want to maximize their career earning opportunities as much as possible so it’s a balance between starting as soon as possible but not so soon that it’s disastrous. (Soccer agent, 2015)

The translators’ perspective reinforces this state of caution and awareness of risk to reputation, characteristics which are heightened in translation:

The last thing that you want is for the club or player to receive abuse because of a typo or poor translation. Once a tweet appears, it can be nigh impossible to delete it entirely as people are so ready to screenshot and grab anything that
they think might be useful for trolling, ridiculing or anything else. (Translator 4, 2017)

The account of the research context for this investigation into the translation of tweets in the soccer industry demonstrates how interconnected the issues are. There is consequently necessary dialogue between all the research questions. Glocalization provides a thread through much of the discussion, signalling its importance to this investigation. The first research question functions as an umbrella for all the questions this investigation poses.

6 Processes of glocalisation in translated tweets

The architecture of different types of soccer club Twitter account have an effect on how the glocalizing process works. There are typically two types: bilingual accounts where tweets are published together in two languages on a single bilingual feed (Figure 4), and monolingual accounts where tweets are published separately in parallel accounts and the tweet translations are presented independently of the source text (Figures 5 and 6).

![Figure 4: ACF Fiorentina. 2018.](image)

![Figure 5: Olympique de Marseille. 2018. Literal translation: Arrived at OM in 2015, Yohann Pelé has extended his contract with OM until 2020.](image)
Translating tweets in the soccer industry

communicate its brand to a more global audience through translation. There is, however, a difference in the ways in which the two types of account exhibit the ‘simultaneity and inter-penetration’ of glocalization that Robertson (2012: 194) describes. The single bilingual account in Figure 4 does this most clearly. Fiorentina retains its identity as an Italian Serie A club but shares that identity with a wider English-speaking audience in translation. It visibly takes its local property of Italian language into a more global context. In contrast, Marseille communicate independently with separate parallel audiences in their parallel French and English accounts. Marseille’s local identity is not compromised and the effect of reaching a wider audience through the use of English is doubtless achieved. There is more scope in the latter process for the translation to differ, for content to be developed independently. In the case of the parallel account, an English-language version of Marseille’s Twitter feed is developed. Content is more or less simultaneous. It is not visibly inter-penetrated in the way content is in the single bilingual account but it remains an example of the heterogeneity of glocalization.

Transnational soccer organizations take a similar glocalizing approach to that seen in Marseille’s Twitter accounts. UEFA, for example, the European Soccer governing body, provide separate parallel monolingual content which can be quite independent: “We are given the freedom to create our own content in French, content that will interest French people and French-speaking people, content that fits our audience. Sometimes, we base our tweets on English tweets to get an idea. It’s not ‘translating’ per se, but it’s as close at it gets” (Translator 5, 2017). Thus UEFA, and many clubs with global ambitions, use parallel Twitter accounts to glocalize by shaping ‘local’ content for specific language audiences worldwide. The translators in this study provided a number of comments/examples of tweets which were composed in English based on a tweet in another language rather than translated by closely following the source language lexis and grammar.

It’s such a small piece of text, often only a few words, that it’s hard to get context and it might be easier to get that message across in X language in five words, you might have to write something completely different to get the same meaning across. (Translator 2, 2015)

Following a high scoring defeat in which a Spanish club conceded six goals before then
scoring four, the club tweeted the headline of a match report: ‘Si compite es muy bueno, pero si no...’ (Literal translation: ‘If it competes it is very well but if not...’). The translator reported considering ‘When the team competes it does very well, but when it is not at it, it doesn’t’ as a translation but assessed it as too long for Twitter. Instead, the sense – and the brevity and style of the original – were captured in a new tweet ‘Spanish Club in Jekyll and Hyde performance’ (Translator 3, 2017).

Lexical choices are frequently inscribed with properties that link them to specific cultural contexts. Those lexical choices can therefore mark out a local context. Categorizations of register can be a way of differentiating one stretch of language from another in terms of variation in context, relating to the language user and/or language use. The translators noted a specific area of contextual variation that derives from the norms of language use in relation to technical language. Describing injuries in technical detail is not the norm in English (see e.g. Jones and Steckelmacher 2012) and technical language is regularly subject to either omission or simplification in translation into English. In response to a question about register shifts, these two comments were collected about club Twitter accounts:

Player injuries is one of the prime examples of this. My thinking is: the tweet is being put out there to inform fans of an injury, therefore it’s better to render the tweet in language that the general public are going to understand. I’ve tried translating literally – and sometimes it’s necessary for official statements – but it really is difficult. (Translator 2, 2017)

I prefer to talk about calf, thigh strain etc. but some clients want the medical term even in English. Personally, it jars and I challenge any non-medical professional to decipher it. (Translator 1, 2017)

Thus translators report adapting the norms of local language use in the source language to the norms of local language use in the target language of English. Avoiding the production of texts which would read awkwardly in English enables the communication to be smooth and fluent and thus does not risk negative PR. By reflecting local norms, the translators are glocalizing, differentiating the various clubs’ Twitter communication in a way that suits the local context.

In contrast, the translators’ approach to hashtags in Twitter accounts does not represent a glocalizing approach. The question of effective indexing for soccer tweet translators working with hashtags underscores how the non-linear production and reading of tweets and posts on social media in general differs from most other kinds of texts. This property means that hashtags, which are generally designed in the commercial context of professional soccer to reach as many consumers as possible, are frequently left untranslated because a translated hashtag would most likely not achieve comparable recognition and

32
reach to the original hashtag (see Desjardins 2017: 49ff), reducing the size of its comparable audience. This is a significant problem for the kind of sponsored or corporate content found in the soccer industry. Unlike hypertext links, hashtags are not necessarily a route to related content because a hashtag is often quite broad in meaning and connotation. It can therefore group together very disparate content from a wide range of sources. One translator commented:

The clubs will try to use a hashtag that works in all languages. For example, Inter put #FCIM at the end of all their tweets (the initials of the club). It doesn’t need translating but serves to collate all Inter-related tweets in one place. If they tweet about a world event, such as Holocaust Day, they’ll use the Italian hashtag and we’ll use the English one. But I would never translate #ForzaJuve to #ComeonJuve, for example. (Translated 1, 2017)

‘#ComeonJuve’ would not have the recognition and reach of #ForzaJuve and so would not achieve similar indexing and topic popularity, and it is worth noting that amongst soccer fans the use of ‘Forza’ outside Italy is to some extent already globalized. It is familiar to many and, for some, has become part of their vernacular as a performative example of identity as a knowledgeable fan following Italian soccer. This property gives the Italian hashtag yet more global reach.

In contrast, a similar but more locally coded hashtag in the following tweet by West Ham’s Manuel Lanzini would not have the same global reach as #ForzaJuve (Figure 7):

Figure 7: Lanzinin, M. 2018.

‘COYI’ stands for ‘Come on You Irons’ which is a standard chant by West Ham fans. ‘Irons’ is shorthand for ‘hammers’ and both are nicknames for the club. ‘COYI’ could not be adapted in the way that the technical language described above could be because meaning and associations are too densely packed for a suitable translation to be found. A further example was provided in this account by one of the translators:

I was tweeting live during the game and as Seville started their comeback from 4-1 down, the following hashtag started to appear at the end of the match tweets: #DicenQueNuncaSeRinde (They say that you should never give up). (Translator 3, 2017)

The translator considered translating this club motto as ‘#it’s not over til it’s over’ but decided not to for the reasons of limited reach discussed above. The translator acknowledged that there had to be a certain cultural loss because the English language audience
“did not get the feeling that this dramatic comeback was linked to one of the club’s values” (Translator 3, 2017). This is thus another example of a local element that could not be carried across to a differentiated context.

A final illustration from UEFA shows an English language hashtag proving to be dominant in the marketplace:

Our main UEFA competition is the UEFA Champions League that has a hashtag all English-speaking fans recognize: #UCL. It has really become a brand in English. In French, we have been using #LdC consistently for years for ‘Ligue des champions’. A few other accounts use it but it hasn’t really caught on. So we’ve started adding #UCL on top of #LdC to be able to have more visibility. (Translator 5, 2017)

“More visibility” is synonymous with more commercial reach. The apparent policy within the soccer industry of creating hashtags which are universally understood or of avoiding the translation of hashtags completely would appear to reflect a less glocalizing strategy than that explored in the translation of technical language relating to injuries. In fact, the strategies could be read as more globalizing where globalizing is understood as a homogenizing process of cultural imperialism. The exploration of glocalizing processes in professional tweet translation in the soccer industry reveals that such processes can be detected even if they manifest themselves in different ways in different contexts. However, it appears that the non-linear property of hashtags leads to commercial decisions to employ a more globalizing/homogenizing approach than the glocalizing approach used for text content. Commercial considerations are similarly prominent when looking at translation and the management of backstage identity on Twitter.

7 Preserving brand identity

As discussed above, the investment of migrant players or coaches, and their agents or representatives, in giving the impression of being authentic through their language use on Twitter has the objective of cultivating a strong commercial relationship with fans. Translation adds an additional layer to the performance of backstage identity. All migrant soccer players or coaches who tweet in a language which is not their first language, or have their tweets translated, place themselves in a position where their use of a language that is foreign to them naturally becomes a prominent feature of their communication, and an aspect of identity that can be staged. The following two contrasting examples both demonstrate a desire to use translation to manage backstage image. The first comes from a translator who was supporting a group of migrant players at an English Premier League club:
I was called upon to translate tweets by one player at various hours of the morning, tweets that were in Spanish that he wanted idiomatically put into English. He was saying something in Spanish that had a certain nuance to it, he wanted to have a translation that had the same punch in English. (Translator 6, 2015)

The translation objective, in this case, is quite clear and in line with professional expectations of fluency from a professional translator. Fluency in the foreign language projects a positive backstage identity which is beneficial in terms of PR and its associated commercial objectives.

The second case, however, is quite different. Here, the translator was explicitly asked to avoid the fluency sought in the first example:

The tweets that I translate have supposedly been composed by the football players/coaches that I’m working for. Whilst my other clients expect readable and natural English translations in tweets, in this instance, I’m asked to pitch the English used in my translations at the level of a foreign football manager, whose grasp of the English language may not be all that great. At times, I have been asked to avoid using a colloquial turn of phrase in a tweet purely on the basis that it would be beyond the grasp of the account owner. I recall suggesting the use of ‘Lady luck shone on...’, which was rejected by the client. (Translator 3, 2017)

An awareness that fluent English would pose a challenge to the audience in terms of their expectation of authenticity and normativity of expression can be observed in the instructions to the translator. The client’s objective was to communicate what the fans might interpret as features of authenticity: “they want to try and avoid Twitter users commenting on tweets and saying things such as, ‘This was obviously not written by X’” (Translator 3, 2017). This concern for preserving authenticity and normativity of expression dictates a non-fluent translation. However much the backstage performance is managed on Twitter, many readers will have a sense of how well that player or coach can actually communicate in that host language through exposure to the player speaking, front stage, in a press conference or a post-match interview where language performance cannot be adjusted in the way it can on social media. From this, readers will know how fluent that player or coach is in the host language. This awareness will play a part in the ‘negotiations’ about authenticity and normativity that Kytölä and Westinen (2015) describe in their analysis of Mikkel Forssell’s use of gangsta language in his tweets.

Assessing authenticity in any non-fluent tweets which derive from press conferences is relatively straightforward. Any manipulation of such tweets by the translator/proof-reader would be detectable because press conferences are now usually filmed and made available
online, thus the original speech could be checked. What is more, press conference texts are texts spoken by the players/coaches. There is no gap between the front stage player/coach identity (idiolect) visible in the press conference and what is communicated backstage via Twitter. The intention to create an illusion is, however, evident in the translation of tweets and the proofreading of non-fluent tweets written in the host language where client instruction to the translator-proofreader has the objective of preserving the ‘authenticity’ of expression in English, or preserving the tweeter’s idiolect. Yet, generally, there is a clear suspension of disbelief because the backstage identity is, in most cases, constructed as the tweets have in all probability not been composed by the players/coaches (see Ruthven 2016). This example of a desire for authenticity in translated tweets is expressed in the context of celebrity tweeting within which there is a widespread belief that the authenticity of tweets is compromised. As this particular translator went on to add “I believe that the feeling that the client has is that Twitter users want to see material that is written by the coaches themselves even though, in reality, everyone recognizes that the large majority of footballing personalities often don’t think up/post their own tweets” (Translator 3, 2017). This is akin to practices in the entertainment industry (see e.g. Kaufman 2013; Desjardins 2017).

The desire to preserve the authenticity of constructed backstage identity is further unveiled through tweets composed in English where the translator is asked to review/proofread rather than translate:

I have received tweets for editing and have been asked by my client not to correct certain turns of phrases which have been used by coaches/players in a press conference. I have also been asked for other tweets written in English as a foreign language not to upgrade the level of English too much, so that it is in keeping with the sort of English that the supposed author could feasibly produce. An example of this might be: ‘Today we made a good game’ versus ‘Today we put in a good performance’. (Translator 3, 2017)

Given that misspellings and grammatical errors are commonly recognized as a sign of authenticity on social media (Marwick and boyd 2011), then preserving a lack of fluency in translated or proofread tweets is in line with the commercial benefits that authenticity brings. This is not incompatible with the first example, where it was argued that a fluent translation (‘with the same punch’) was good for PR. However, to turn back briefly to RQ1, the two examples described above – providing a fluent translation, and preserving a lack of fluency in translated or proofread tweets – both provide illustrations of different strategies of glocalization. The fluent example enables the migrant player to communicate with differentiated markets while the non-fluent example enables the migrant coach’s local identity to remain visible as well as authentic. This brings the investigation to the question
of visibility in translation.

8 Fluency and the visibility of the translator/translation process

The unusual example above of a lack of fluency actively sought by clients in order to sustain the illusion of authenticity in celebrity tweets is especially interesting in relation to visibility in Translation Studies. In terms of translation strategies, it is a rare example of foreignization. This is a strategy promoted by Venuti because it makes the translation process, the translator and the source language/culture, visible in a way that is highly unusual in most professional translation contexts and, in particular, in commercial contexts. Yet, despite the strategy’s rarity as a practice, it is motivated by precisely the same concerns with positive brand management as the more usual practice of fluent translation.

Translation/translator invisibility can be compounded by the rapidity of communication enabled by technology. Once a tweet is published, immediacy is key to effective communication: “if you’re working for a major client, and football clubs generally are, you better translate it quickly for the official account otherwise someone else will report it before you” (Translator 1, 2017). It is the tweets that need reacting to and so need translating fast which are most challenging for the professional translator in soccer. There are two principal contexts for live tweets: live press conferences where a manager or a player speaks to the assembled press, and live matches which will be the focus here: “There was certainly pressure to translate them quickly during matches as, if there’s been a goal, the fans need to know fast!” (Translator 3, 2017). The speed with which tweets can be posted creates an expectation of high speed translation, in particular for users used to automatic online translation tools. This gives the impression that the translation has indeed been carried out simultaneously and automatically even if professional human translators are involved. By posting tweet translations rapidly translators thus reinforce their own invisibility (Desjardins 2017: 111). The pressure to translate quickly, however, has the potential to affect translation quality: “In some instances, this has seen me be less adventurous with translations, given that there is simply not enough time to check things before submitting” (Translator 3, 2017); “Increased chances of typos/meaning errors” (Translator 1, 2017); “a typo can reflect very poorly on a club’s image which is not great” (Translator 2, 2017).

For live matches, the challenge of creating quality fast translations of live tweets can be compounded by not being able to see what is being described:

As soon as they tweet in X language, we need to go in English. This can be tricky as you want to be watching the game to know what’s happened before you tweet, as going on their tweet alone would open up a lot of scope for error. (Translator 2, 2015)
A series of technical challenges can mitigate against fast translation:

Often you have to do 3 matches at a time (...) so it can often happen that X club, Y club and Z club are playing at the same time. (...) You can’t really get much context from a tweet so I’m guessing that what we actually put in English is often not the best description of what happened. (Translator 2, 2015)

Take scoring a goal, for example – there are so many ways to put the ball in the back of the net: you could thump it, dink it, slot it, smash it, fire it, thrash it, thunder it, sweep it, roll it home. You can’t really pick one of those in full confidence without first having seen the goal, so that can be an issue if you’re trying to follow a game and keep an eye on the Twitter feed at the same time. (Translator 2, 2017)

This description is similar to the experience of video game translators who, more often than not, cannot see the game for the context they need to translate well (see e.g. Mangiron and O’Hagan 2006). Errors created by a combination of time pressure or a lack of the right tools make the translation process, and by extension the translator, visible as well as affecting the reputation of the client and the translator/translation provider.

Visual literacy-based text on Twitter, in contrast, raises little debate about translator visibility because translation is largely not required. Images, video clips, and emojis represent social media content that is becoming increasingly important and requires users to be more and more visually literate (Desjardins 2017: 53). Emojis have now become a global phenomenon: according to Evans (2017), in 2015, over 6 billion emojis were being sent every day by over 90 percent of the world’s online population, a global reach that surpasses that of any language (see also Alshenqeeti 2016). Emojis represent a global communication practice which transcends linguistic and cultural boundaries. The use of emojis in tweets in the soccer industry, as in other contexts, fulfils a globalizing function similar to the non-translation of English language hashtags without the linguistic imperialism.

There is research which demonstrates that ascribing universality to emojis is, however, not always a safe assumption. Danesi (2017), for example, devotes a chapter to cross-cultural variation in emojis explaining how different emojis may be subject to different historical and cultural associations of meaning. The use of emojis nonetheless remains at the globalizing (homogenizing) end of the globalizing/glocalizing spectrum, though the context in which they are used can affect their position on that spectrum. Here are two examples of emojis used by football clubs: one a Juventus pre-season tour tweet on their Italian Twitter account (Figure 8), the other a Bayer Leverkusen in-game tweet in their English language Twitter account (Figure 9):
In each case, the emojis convey additional meaning that is not explicitly expressed in the tweet itself. Although the use of the ‘strong’ emoji in the Juventus tweet is likely to be universally understood, it is employed within the club’s Italian language twitter account which glocalizes the tweet it appears in towards an Italian-speaking audience. While the fire emoji communicates the sentiment clearly, it potentially requires knowledge of the English language to decode the implicit reference to the expression ‘to be on fire’ i.e. to be performing extremely well, though similar expressions may exist in other languages. The extra knowledge required dilutes the emoji’s universality rendering its use less globalizing. Yet the emoji is used in the context of Bayer Leverkusen’s English language Twitter account so the communication is already glocalized towards an English-speaking audience. So, while emojis do not need translating and are generally universally understood, the context in which they are used, and/or the need for additional linguistic knowledge to decode the emoji can lend them a more glocalized character than might initially be assumed.

The fact that emojis do not need translating does potentially pose a threat to the translation profession. Desjardins (2017: 54) argues that if non-text-based communication like the use of emojis continues to develop in importance then the need for translation could diminish and calls for translator training to look beyond the verbal. However, the use of images rather than text in global advertising campaigns to overcome the challenge of adapting marketing to different linguistic and cultural contexts is not at all a new strategy (see e.g. Adab and Valdés 2004; Mooij 2005).
9 Concluding remarks and implications for future research

Using questionnaire and interview data which provide multiple perspectives, this article analyzed a new area of translation practice in the soccer industry. The work is innovative in two ways. Firstly, it contributes to minimal existing research into the new area of social media and translation, especially from the perspective of professional practice. Secondly, the interrogation of translation and Twitter in the soccer industry begins to address the research gap in the field of Sport and Communication of communication challenges faced by migrant players and coaches and the clubs and associations that host them in the global sports industry. In line with Hutchins’ recommendation that research into Twitter should focus more centrally on commodification, the argument underlines the significance of the intersection between professional translation work on Twitter and the highly PR-conscious global industry/culture of soccer. It has demonstrated that when tweets produced by soccer players, their agents, soccer clubs, and governing organizations are translated, there is a constant eye kept on the management of ‘authentic’ backstage (after Goffman) online identity and its economic potential. A common concern is visibility to maximize potential revenue. This sensitivity of clients to promoting and protecting the image of their brand manifests itself in tweet translations, both in the industry norm of fluent translation but also in the highly unusual practice of deliberate non-fluent translation. In the latter practice, the concern is not with clear communication but with the preservation of authentic identity in language expression, despite the common assumption about who actually authors tweets in celebrity contexts. Features that reinforce the marketable value of authenticity in social media are misspellings and grammatical errors which are detected both in tweet translation and proofreading practice. These practices produce the kind of foreignization in translation that Venuti advocates to render source culture and language visible because players’ or coaches’ ‘foreignness’ remains evident through non-fluent language use, as implicitly does their culture, and the process of translation. The time pressure that the translators of tweets work under, especially in live in-match tweeting, can affect fluency and accuracy, and technical factors can affect visibility. On the one hand, the speed of technology creates audience expectations that assume automatic translation is the tool being used, making rapid human translators invisible. On the other hand, delays in producing and posting translated tweets caused by technology make the presence of translation more visible than is usually desirable in the industry.

The very particular practice of translating tweets in a non-fluent way or maintaining awkward host-language features of a migrant player or coach’s tweets is one striking example in a range of ways in which players and clubs in particular have been shown to glocalize in the way they approach tweet translation, tailoring their brand to differentiated markets, “securing a profitable global presence [...] [by] operating in the languages of the
local” (Giulianotti and Robertson 2007: 34). In fact, the range of practices identified reflect a spectrum of globalizing (homogenizing) and glocalizing strategies. On the one hand there is the globalizing non-translation of English language hashtags. On the other hand local linguistic identity is preserved both in the use of bilingual Twitter accounts where two languages appear side by side, and in the use of parallel monolingual accounts. In the latter, local identity is preserved in one account and localized language audiences are targeted in other accounts, or indeed in the need for additional linguistic knowledge to decode emojis. There is, however, far more evidence in the data of glocalizing practices than of globalizing practices indicating that tweet translation reflects the general global commercial behavior of major sports teams as transnational corporations described by Giulianotti and Robertson.

The findings of the current investigation do help develop understanding of digital interactions in contexts of linguistic diversity in professional soccer. They encourage sports marketing departments to reflect on their use of Twitter and translation to better inform their brand management. The findings provide the platform referred to earlier for more research into the professional practice of social media translation in other linguistically diverse sectors of the sports industry, and indeed in other commercial contexts. For example, a more comprehensive study of how the non-linear hashtag is handled across linguistic and cultural barriers in sport communication contexts would help determine to what extent general practice reflects homogenizing globalization processes or more the successful glocalizing business practices that dominate in the data discussed above. The examples presented above of the use of emojis in soccer club tweets and their ‘translation’ invite a broader assessment from the perspective of translation practitioners of the effect on the translation profession of the need for increased visual literacy in decoding communication on social media. Does this evolution in communication genuinely threaten the translation profession as Desjardins claims?

The role of translation in the management of the backstage identity of soccer players and coaches on social media uncovered here adds another layer to the processes which contribute to the construction of online identity, and the marketability of that identity.

In casting a light on Twitter translation in the context of professional soccer, this study has merely scratched the surface of the virtually uninvestigated communication challenges faced by migrant players and coaches in the soccer industry, and of the clubs, associations and fan bases that host and support them. Despite the extremely diverse character of most global professional sport communities (audiences, sponsors, owners, and athletes and coaches), such work is highly unusual in the context of sport and communication studies. The complex navigation between local and global identity detailed above in Twitter translation is likely to also feature prominently in a range of communication contexts for these migrants, between first language and host language, and potentially via...
shared languages that bridge the gap between the two. Whether it be communication in professional situations such as recruitment medicals, media work, or training, or in extra-professional situations such as finding a home, understanding tax laws, or using health services, there is much more to be discovered to understand and support communication for these migrants.

References


Translating tweets in the soccer industry


In: *PLoS ONE* 8.4, e61981. [URL](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0061981).


Clinical empathy in medical consultations in Japan
An exploration of the medical education context

Kayo Kondo
University of East Anglia

Abstract Extant research has provided evidence of a positive link between doctors’ expressions of empathy and increased patient satisfaction with the quality of care (e.g. Hojat et al. 2010; Silverman, Kurtz, and Draper 2013). In the Japanese context, several studies have reported that Japanese doctors’ expressions of empathy were extremely infrequent (e.g. Ishikawa et al. 2002a,b; Wheeler 2011) and that doctors are often described as being distant and that such attitudes towards patients commonly result in complaints from foreign residents of Japan. This study examines how and why the expression of empathy observed among Japanese doctors is so limited. A structured literature search of clinical communication skills textbooks and guidelines for the medical education context was undertaken. The review highlights the following three contributing factors: 1) clinical empathy, as a concept in clinical communication, remains reflective of the Western conceptions, and uncertainty lies behind the conceptualisation and definition of clinical empathy in the Japanese context; 2) most references to empathy in Japan are representative of Japanese doctors’ listening style; 3) there is a notable lack of encouragement to elicit information (e.g. concerns, ideas, expectations) from patients.

1 Introduction

It has been half a century since the theoretical basis of doctor-patient communication came into focus in the 1960s. Scholars and educators came to believe that successful medical consultations could be achieved by understanding patients’ concerns and feelings, which requires a degree of empathy (Northouse and Northouse 1997; Silverman, Kurtz, and Draper 2013). Different disciplinary approaches to empathy have yielded various definitions of the term. While the English word ‘empathy’ refers to one’s ability to understand human emotions during interactions with others (Oxford Dictionaries 2015), Howe (2013)...

*My sincere gratitude goes to Dr Eiji Kaneko of the Institute of Education at Tokyo Medical and Dental University, and Dr Daisuke Son of the International Research Centre for Medical Education, Graduate School of Medicine at The University of Tokyo, for providing me with their knowledge of medical interviews, SPs, and the OSCE guidelines and insightful advice.

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. Copyright is retained by the author.
Clinical empathy in medical consultations in Japan

proposes that empathy also requires an active effort or a cognitive challenge. Studies have shown that empathy can be the dynamics at the heart of communication between people, and that it ultimately supports positive social interaction outcomes (Broome 1991; Davis 1994; Howe 2013).

The term clinical empathy is commonly used in medical care. Brugel, Postma-Nilsenova, and Tates (2015) provide that clinical empathy is a professional skill that doctors consciously use to achieve successful consultations. Clinical empathy comprises three elements: (1) cognition: the intellectual capacity to recognise and understand the patient’s emotions; (2) motivation: the motivation to communicate this understanding; and (3) behaviour: the capacity to transfer this understanding through effective communication (Brugel, Postma-Nilsenova, and Tates 2015: 1261). Lawrence et al. (2004) summarise the concept of empathy defined in psychology, noting that two principal dimensions of empathy exist: cognitive empathy and emotional empathy (also called ‘affec-tive empathy’). Emotional empathy can be divided further into two dimensions, parallel and reactive emotional empathy, the latter of which can be manifested in sympathy or compassion. Davis (1994) explains that empathy is the ability to sense people’s feelings and views intellectually and to achieve an imaginative understanding, which is a truly empathic reaction. On the one hand, emotional empathy involves emotive responses to others with similar emotions, called parallel emotional empathy, while on the other hand, instant emotive responses to others with different emotions represent sympathy or compassion. Cognitive empathy alone is not adequate for sensing how another person reacts to and appreciates emotional connections in interpersonal relationships; this requires emotional empathy. Consequently, this might cause confusion regarding the definitions of empathy and sympathy. It is important to distinguish empathy from sympathy. Northouse and Northouse (1997: 24) describe sympathy as “concern, sorrow or pity shown by an individual for another individual. It is the expression of one’s own feelings about another person’s predicament and the urge to alleviate his or her suffering”. Sympathy is used to signify the ‘resonance’ aspect of emotion and is viewed as containing elements that are passive in nature. In contrast, ‘empathy’ is believed to involve more active elements, such as making an effort to step outside the self (Davis 1994: 5).

Studies have provided evidence of a positive correlation between doctors’ expressions of empathy and increased patient satisfaction with quality of care and recovery rates (Hojat et al. 2010; Silverman, Kurtz, and Draper 2013). However, disagreements have surfaced on demonstrating empathy to patients because in some cases, such as with acute care, doctors must make detached diagnoses that require keeping some level of professional distance between themselves and their patients (Washer 2009). To some degree, doctors must learn to hide their feelings from patients – usually an aspect of their education – which likely leads to more detached care (Colliver et al. 2010; Neumann et al. 2011; Pas-
salacqua and Segrin 2012). Unfortunately, empathy in medical students and residents is subject to decline over the course of their training (this will be further reviewed in Section 2.3). Furthermore, medical professionals need to operate in highly challenging circumstances – e.g. under heavy workloads and tight schedules – making it difficult for them to improve their empathic skills. Un-empathic medical professionals might neglect their patients’ emotional cues and fail to achieve an understanding of their patients’ situations, while over-detachment can lead to serious consequences for themselves in clinical practice (Buckman, Tulsky, and Rodin 2011; Faulkner 1998; Kerasidou and Horn 2016). Health system factors such as environment and waiting times also would need to be explored, along with relationships.

In Japan, doctors traditionally do not explain details in clinical settings, and patients tend to talk very little, rarely voicing their own feelings and concerns to their doctors (Yajima and Takayanagi 1998). Although patients are more informed than ever, most patients prefer to leave choices and important decisions to the professionals. Cultural studies have revealed that due to the social emphasis on group-oriented harmony over individual goals, the use of indirectness to reduce interpersonal friction and people’s feelings of belonging to groups take precedence over their personal feelings (Barnlund 1989; Hofstede, Hofstede, and Minkov 2010). Wheeler (2011) claims that Japanese doctors are often described as being cold and distant, and that such unsympathetic attitudes towards patients commonly result in complaints from foreign residents in Japan. Studying this noticeable aspect of Japanese physician-patient consultation styles, Ishikawa et al. (2002a,b) report low scores on displays of empathy among Japanese physicians and that their expressions of empathy were extremely infrequent. Kataoka et al. (2009) examined differences in empathy scores among Japanese medical students in different years of study using psychometric measurements. The scores showed that overall female empathy levels were higher than male levels, and that the mean empathy scores increased from the first year to the last year of medical school. Furthermore, the principal elements of empathy, such as ‘compassionate care’, ‘perspective-taking’ and ‘the ability to stand in a patient’s shoes’, were the same elements observed in U.S. and Mexican medical students. However, the mean score for the Japanese sample was lower than that for the U.S. and Mexican medical students. In an attempt to explain this lower mean score for the Japanese sample, medical education differences and differences in expressions of empathy were offered as explanations (Kataoka et al. 2009).

Specifically, science-oriented medical curricula, the different medical school admissions systems and Japanese patients’ preferences for calm and unemotional clinicians are considered to be factors that potentially influence scores. In the present study, the principle objective will be to examine how and why the use of empathy observed among Japanese doctors is so limited. This objective will be accomplished by identifying how clinical empathy is conceptualised in the context of medical education, determining to what extent a
link exists between Japanese doctors’ display of empathy and the medical school curricula. Through this, the present study will be able to identify the specific cultural communication style that emerges when Japanese doctors express empathy towards patients.

To achieve this, the present study conducted a structured literature review by considering the following research questions:

1. What is the nature of the existing consultation skills training and relevant examination in Japan?

2. Are any contextual barriers presenting that prevent Japanese doctors from showing empathy towards their patients?

This structured review was intended to identify the salient factors that affect clinical consultations in Japan and form the basis for promoting the use of clinical empathy in the current context of Japanese medical education. To address the first research question, the most widespread learning syllabi, educational guidelines and policy documents from Japanese medical institutions were chosen and used to confirm the educational textbooks’ content referenced in medical interview skills training. The materials with the Japanese term kyōkan (empathy) in their content received particular attention. To answer the second research question, empirical studies conducted to assess empathy among Japanese medical students, residents and clinicians were reviewed. The article search was initiated in MEDLINE and Ichushi-Web. The focus was directed towards published papers that contain the term ‘empathy’ in their titles and abstracts and ‘Japan’ in their main text, and for Japanese articles, the Japanese term kyōkan (empathy) in their titles and abstracts. The search was restricted to these publications to keep the review at a manageable volume of full texts. Conference abstracts, book reviews and letters were excluded. The timeframe parameter of these searches was May to July 2016.

Section 2 explores the current debate on the assessment of clinical empathy. Section 3 presents the results from the structured literature reviews, and Section 4 deepens the discussion of the findings. The last section concludes the present study and identifies limitations and recommendations for future research.

2 Assessment of clinical empathy

2.1 Jefferson Scale of Empathy

Healthcare professionals’ performance of clinical empathy can be assessed by using multiple choice questions, short answer questions and reports on patients’ perceptions of their healthcare providers’ attitudes.
The Jefferson Scale of Empathy (JSE) is a 20-item psychometric scale for measuring the empathy of physicians (JSPE version), medical students (S version), health professionals (HP version) and health-profession students (HPS version). The JSPE asks physicians to self-report on a seven-point scale. A higher score on the scale indicates greater empathy. Permission to use the scale has been given in 83 countries, and it has been translated into 53 languages and dialects, including Japanese (Jefferson Scale of Empathy 2016; Hojat et al. 2001).

Hojat et al. (2002) assessed physicians’ empathy using the JSPE and found that female physicians’ JSPE scores were significantly higher than male physicians’ scores, and that psychiatrists had greater empathy than specialists in anaesthesiology, orthopaedic surgery, obstetrics, gynaecology or general surgery. There was little difference in the scores of physicians who are engaged in internal medicine, paediatrics, emergency medicine and family medicine. These results offer empirical evidence on empathy and help explain gender and professional differences in empathy.

The relationship between JSPE scores and patients’ awareness was examined. Glaser et al. (2007) revealed that physicians’ empathy and patients’ assessments were significantly correlated, i.e. the more patients feel that their physicians are concerned about their feelings, the more likely patients are to assess that their physicians have considered their wishes when making treatment decisions. The results gave further validity to the JSPE and supported evidence that shows a relationship between self-reporting psychometric measurements by physicians and patients’ perspectives.

2.2 Objective Structured Clinical Examinations

In undergraduate medical, dental and health science curricula, the Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) is used in countries worldwide to assess clinical competence in different healthcare professions. Japanese medical education officially introduced the OSCE in 2005. The examination consists of a series of ‘stations’, and at each station, students are asked clinical performance questions and given scores by examiners according to their knowledge, performance and communicative attitudes (Harden 2016). The OSCE employs a simulated patient (SP) who is trained to act as a patient at each station. The SP is required to provide the same experience to all students taking the OSCE, then to give feedback on their performance. The use of trained SPs allows students’ performance to be evaluated under the same conditions (Harden 2016).

Hodges et al. (1996) examined the feasibility of developing medical students’ communication skills and the reliability and generalisability of the OSCE. They found that performance of communication skills (e.g. rapport building, empathy, interview techniques and dealing with emotions) was linked to knowledge of the clinical encounters’ content. Conversely, poor communication skills might hamper the gathering of content,
Clinical empathy in medical consultations in Japan

even when the student possesses adequate knowledge of the patient’s problem. Brannick, Erol-Korkmaz, and Prewett (2011) pointed out that it can be more difficult to assess communication skills than clinical skills reliably when considering both skills as general traits. Although the OSCE is now standardised and used as an objective method of evaluation, reliably assessing students’ communication skills is more complex, for example, due to differences between scenarios that create communication difficulties and easier or more difficult scenarios.

2.3 Failure to respond to patients’ emotions

Although empirical studies and theoretical conceptualisations of empathy have emphasised the importance of empathy in clinical settings, doctors tend to be focused more on task-oriented communication, such as asking questions and providing information, and less on showing empathy, and they are likely to fail to respond to patients’ emotions (Butalid, Bensing, and Verhaak 2014). Levinson and Pizzo (2011) found several reasons why doctors fail to respond to patients’ emotions: 1) pressure: doctors are often under pressure since they need to deal with emotionally distressing situations within limited timeframes; thus, they often feel a need to quicken the pace of their interactions; 2) time constraints: even though mastering communication skills could improve their efficiency, listening to patients requires considerable time, which they often do not have; and 3) limited feedback: medical schools provide relatively limited education on effective communication skills, and medical students are rarely observed during their consultations with patients or given feedback to improve their communication skills.

Taking the time to communicate with each patient and respond in a facilitative manner is considered an essential clinical practice that ultimately results in better patient outcomes (Silverman, Kurtz, and Draper 2013). However, the circumstances that doctors must face on a daily basis also lead to compassion fatigue and emotional exhaustion. Gleichgerrcht and Decety (2013) developed a questionnaire that determines which aspects of clinical empathy are related to positive or negative outcomes, focusing on compassion, satisfaction and burnout among physicians. Physicians who experienced compassion fatigue – defined as having little or no satisfaction (or the pleasure derived from performing one’s job well) – had the highest scores for personal stress as well as the strongest indicators for compassion fatigue. Washer (2009: 14) notes that “if you become too involved with your patients, there is a danger that you will become less able to provide what they need from you”. It has been suggested that professionals need to maintain a level of professional distance between themselves and their patients, while demonstrating that they understand the patients’ perspectives.

Some studies examined the decline of empathy among medical students and its association with burnout. Krasner et al. (2009) found that student burnout can occur early
in the medical educational process, and that students’ emotional exhaustion can be linked
to a decreased ability to express empathy. Neumann et al. (2011) undertook a systematic
literature review on empathy decline in medical students and residents, and demonstrated
that decreases in displays of empathy were explicitly present. Medical students need to
develop their confidence and the ability to manage complex interactions. It can be said
that clinical communication assessments through the OSCE and skills training using sim-
ulated patients (SPs) for the clinical examination would play a significant role in students’
progress.

3 Results

3.1 Results for Question 1: Conceptualising empathy in the education
context

3.1.1 Guidelines

In The White Paper on Medical Education in Japan, Moriya (2014) indicated that, al-
though details regarding the number of classes for communication skills training in each
medical school in Japan have not been publicised and remain uncertain to this day, the
demand for communication skills training can be assumed to have expanded, with a par-
ticular emphasis on clinical clerkship (a style of clinical training wherein students are
involved in medical care for patients as members of a medical care team in a hospital
ward). In response to the official introduction of the OSCE, most of the medical schools
in Japan have administered the test to students during the latter half of their fourth
year of study. This has considerably affected students’ preparation for medical interviews,
communication and clinical skills (Moriya 2014). The Core Curriculum in Medical Educa-
tion 2010 was developed as a set of guidelines for use in conjunction with the OSCE; the
learning and evaluation items in the instrument were formulated on the basis of Ministry

From examples of the checklist for medical interviews, as part of the assessment of
the OSCE, empathic communication skills can be summarised as follows: 1) maintain eye
contact with the patient, not only when asking questions but also when listening to the
patient; 2) use plain language to support the patient’s understanding; 3) take an approp-
riate posture when listening to the patient; 4) take an attentive listening stance by using
open-ended questions throughout the consultation; 5) use fillers and nods to facilitate
communication with the patient; 6) use an appropriate listening style, for example, avoid
interrupting the patient; and 7) use appropriate verbal techniques (e.g. volume and tone
of voice and paraphrasing, repeating, summarising and/or conforming the patient’s state-
tments); and 8) express empathy towards the patient’s feelings and circumstances verbally
Clinical empathy in medical consultations in Japan

and non-verbally, i.e. verbal expressions are not enough (Common Achievement Tests Organization 2016: 77). It was noticeable that most of these communication items focus on doctors’ listening styles during consultations and describe non-verbal expressions of empathic attitudes. Another checklist for medical interviews mostly comprises information gathering on medical history, as well as emotional and social information (Common Achievement Tests Organization 2016).

The administration has also affected competence requirements in medical education at the time of graduation. Some medical schools have presented their own competence requirements on their websites as learning outcomes that focus on the education process (Takagi 2014). The 2016 Educational Guidelines for the School of Medicine at Tokyo Medical and Dental University provide examples of the communicative competence with patients and their families, as well as the recognition of the importance of empathy that students require upon graduation. The examples are listed as follows (original Japanese text is shown in Footnote 1):

Professionalism: Interpersonal relationship as a specialist

- Capable of contacting patients and their families with empathy, respect and consideration;
- Capable of showing respect, empathy, responsibility, credibility and faithfulness in interaction with other specialists in medical care settings; and
- Capable of taking actions required for building rapport between patients and their families during medical care.

Communication: Communication with patients and their families

- Capable of communicating with patients and their families while keeping a stance to support patients/their families faithfully; and
- Capable of participating in a discussion with patients and their families as a member of a medical care team regarding serious, sensitive and difficult

1プロフェッショナリズム：専門職としての対人関係
- 患者および家族と、共感、敬意、思いやりをもって接することができる
- 医療における他の専門職との交流に際して、尊敬、共感、責任能力、信頼性、誠実さを示すことができる
- 診療において、患者や患者家族とのラボール構築のために必要な行動をとることができる

コミュニケーション：患者および家族とのコミュニケーション
- 患者や患者家族と、誠実で、常に患者/患者家族をサポートする姿勢を保ちながら、コミュニケーションをとることができる
- 重大で繊細な難しいトピック（性史、疾患名告知、退院計画議論、ターミナルケアなど）についての患者や患者家族との議論に、診療チームの一員として参加する

(Tokyo Medical and Dental University 2016: 197-200)
topics (sexual history, notification of disease name, discharge schedule discussion, terminal care, etc.)

These competencies, set as philosophical goals for graduates, contain skills for empathic interactions that emphasise rapport building and displaying respectful and supportive attitudes while also placing the importance of remaining scientific stances to maximise their professional roles. Although these are only some of the examples in the requirement, a significant number of interaction goals are listed in the guidelines published online (Tokyo Medical and Dental University 2016).

3.1.2 Educational textbooks

Five textbooks that were widely used in the syllabi of Japanese medical schools were reviewed. These materials were written by Japanese authors and were used for medical interview and clinical skills training. Table 1 categorises the primary objective of the material and definitions of empathy in clinical consultations.

Three materials in Table 1 primarily feature the OSCE (Furutani and Tanabe 2007; Suzuki and Abe 2011; Common Achievement Tests Organization 2016), and the other two illustrate case scenarios and communication techniques in medical interviews (Saito 2000; Iijima 2006). More specifically, Saito (2000: 52) suggests two aspects: 1) ‘empathic expressions by listening’ using nods, fillers, repeating and clarification; and 2) ‘skills for support and empathy’. Here, Saito provides five skills and examples adapted from The Medical Interview proposed by Cohen-Cole (1994): reflection (e.g. ‘You seem to be frustrated’), legitimisation (e.g. ‘It is a painful situation, as anyone can see’), support (e.g. ‘I would like to do as much as I can’), partnership (e.g. ‘Let’s think about this problem together’) and respect (e.g. ‘While in a painful situation, you have been working hard’). Saito also notes that although ‘support’ is an approach to make the patient feel better, it is not always ‘empathic’. Supportive comments might impede the doctor from listening to the patient and make the patient feel a lack of empathy (Saito 2000: 55). In sum, verbally expressed empathy in this context can be displayed by fillers, clarification and reflection, which mostly show an engagement (e.g. ‘I am listening to you’), and this can be attentive, but indirect.

The five sets of materials in Table 1 provide conceptual definitions of clinical empathy. Although the explanations are brief, the term ‘empathic attitudes’ is frequently mentioned. Cognitive aspects as reflective of ‘understanding’ and ‘acknowledgement’ are coherent in these descriptions, as well as ‘sharing emotions’ such as anger and sadness (Common Achievement Tests Organization 2016; Furutani and Tanabe 2007; Suzuki and Abe 2011). It can be fair to say that most of these definitions are much closer to the ambiguity between empathy and sympathy. Furthermore, the explanations are simplified regarding verbally
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Primary objective</th>
<th>Definitions of clinical empathy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Iijima (2006)</td>
<td>To deepen understanding of what is 'good communication' in clinical interactions for young doctors</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furutani and Tanabe (2007)</td>
<td>To acquire the basis of clinical skills techniques, which is required for students who take the OSCE</td>
<td>“Having an empathic attitude means trying to share patients’ emotions and understanding their circumstances, which enable patients to relieve stress and worry” (p. 12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Achievement Tests Organization (2016) [Institutional manual]</td>
<td>To provide comprehensive overviews of the OSCE and manuals for medical interview skills for OSCE candidates and examiners</td>
<td>“To show understanding through language or behaviour that signifies one understands patients’ feelings and their circumstances; to properly make eye contact while listening to patients; to nod, give verbal acknowledgement and paraphrase; and to minimise interruptions” (p. 77)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saito (2000)</td>
<td>To grasp the basis of one’s ability regarding clinical communication and examples of expressions and attitudes</td>
<td>“Empathy occurs naturally when a doctor’s feelings become unified with the patient’s feelings, both suffering together when the patient suffers, and being pleased together when the patient is happy” (p. 55).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzuki and Abe (2011)</td>
<td>To develop a comprehensive understanding of medical interview skills performed in the OSCE and SPs</td>
<td>“Medical care staff often face strong emotions from patients, such as anger or sadness. Empathy in such cases is about understanding the sequence of events that stimulates these feelings in patients and by communicating with understanding” (p. 11).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Summary of educational materials published in Japan
eliciting patients’ statements, even though the educational guidelines place much emphasis on developing those skills for medical students.

3.2 Results for Question 2: Assessment of empathy in empirical studies

Six studies conducted empirical explorations of the assessment of clinical empathy for Japanese medical students, residents and clinicians. Among the six, two evaluated the empathy scores of medical students in different years, one used the Japanese version of the JSE-S (Kataoka et al. 2009; Abe et al. 2013), whereas the other used the Trait Emotional Intelligence Questionnaire-Short Form (TEIQue-SF) together with the JSE-S to examine the differences between emotional intelligence and empathy in medical students (Abe et al. 2013). Aomatsu et al. (2013) conducted focus group discussions with medical students and residents to highlight the conceptual structure of empathy qualitatively. Two other studies measured empathy among clinicians, with one employing the Japanese version of the JSEP to examine differences through in-group comparisons of female physicians (Kataoka et al. 2012), and the other examining videotaped consultations between oncologists and SPs, using a behaviour rating scale to explore how each oncologist’s characteristics influenced his or her empathic behaviour when delivering bad news (Kondo et al. 2013). The final study was a survey of patients in a primary medical care clinic, for which the Japanese version of the Consultation and Relational Empathy (CARE) measure was used (Aomatsu et al. 2014). Table 2 categorises the instruments used, sample sizes and study results.

Five studies in Table 2 are written in English, and one is in Japanese. The researchers used measurements developed in Western countries, such as the JSPE, and translated them into Japanese through back-translation procedures. These studies applied the original Western concepts and the definitions of empathy in their measurements, for example, Hojat and colleagues’ (2007: 80) consideration of empathy as “a predominantly cognitive (rather than emotional) attribute that involves an understanding (rather than a feeling) of the patient’s experiences, concerns and perspectives of the patient, combined with a capacity to communicate this understanding”. Although these definitions reflect the Western concepts, the studies did not delve further into the concept of kyōkan (empathy) and the Japanese social context.

Aomatsu et al.’s (2013) study explored the conceptual structures of empathy between medical students and residents. While the medical students thought sharing patients’ emotions was indispensable to displaying empathy, the residents believed, through clinical experience, that showing empathy depends on the patient’s illness and anxiety factors (Aomatsu et al. 2013). This is clearly based on their clinical experience, as residents can cognitively decide what would be more appreciated in specific circumstances. These features seem more indicative of doctors’ empathy as indirect expressions in response to patients’ needs. As for declines in students’ empathy, it has been reported that their
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Instrument used</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kataoka et al. (2009)</td>
<td>The Japanese version of the JSE-S</td>
<td>400 medical students in different years</td>
<td>Female empathy levels outscored males’ levels, and empathy scores increased as students progressed through the course in the cross-sectional study. However, the mean score for the Japanese sample was lower than those of U.S. and Mexican medical students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kataoka et al. (2012)</td>
<td>The Japanese version of the JSPE</td>
<td>285 female physicians</td>
<td>Differences between people-oriented physicians and technology-oriented specialists were found; the former had significantly higher mean empathy scores than the latter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kondo et al. (2013)</td>
<td>Videotaped consultations were analysed, and the behaviour rating scale was adopted to assess the quality and quantity of each empathic behaviour</td>
<td>60 oncologists and six trained SPs</td>
<td>Only age was related to empathy score; younger oncologists had higher scores than older oncologists.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aomatsu et al. (2013)</td>
<td>Two focus group discussions, in which participants were asked open-ended questions: The initial question was ‘What do you think about the role of empathy in clinical practice?’</td>
<td>Six medical students and seven residents</td>
<td>Medical students and residents had different conceptual structures of empathy: Medical students thought that sharing emotions with patients was essential to showing empathy, whereas residents expressed empathy in accordance with their evaluation of patients’ health status.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abe et al. (2013)</td>
<td>The Japanese versions of the TEIQue-SF and JSE-S</td>
<td>370 medical students in different years</td>
<td>The total TEIQue-SF scores tended to decrease as the students advanced. The total JSE-S scores significantly decreased in Year 4 but increased in Year 6. Male students had higher TEIQue-SF scores, and female students had higher JSE-S scores. No differences were found among school years. The scores on the TEIQue-SF and the JSE-S were weakly correlated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aomatsu et al. (2014)</td>
<td>The Japanese version of CARE</td>
<td>317 patients in a primary medical care clinic</td>
<td>The findings supported the validity and reliability of the Japanese CARE measure in a primary care setting. Positive correlations with patients’ overall satisfaction were found.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Summary of the assessment of clinical empathy in the Japanese context
scores significantly decreased in their fourth year, but increased in the sixth year (Abe et al. 2013). However, Aomatsu et al. (2013) noted that students’ empathy does not simply decline, but rather changes qualitatively in clinical practice, as they develop skills in a professional role.

4 Discussion

The reviews of the extant literature reveal that empathy is referred to widely in policy documents and educational guidelines. This includes extensive references in the educational materials to how clinicians are expected to act in response to their patients’ emotions during medical consultations. Elements of empathic communication are also evaluated or assumed to be an object of assessment in the OSCE in Japan. Therefore, infrequent displays of empathy noticed in past studies cannot be explained in terms of any lack of recognition of the value of empathy. However, research is lacking in regard to characteristics of Japanese doctors’ empathy in the context of cultural expectations. It also remains unclear how relationship-building and gathering information to effectively account for patients’ beliefs and anxieties might be achieved in practice in the Japanese context. Clinical empathy as a concept and use of the term remain reflective of the Western conception, and this deficiency might be related to uncertainty behind the term’s conceptualisation and, particularly, to its application in the Japanese medical context.

The OSCE evaluation guidelines clearly require students to engage in empathic attitudes, which are then observed and assessed. Although the existing consultation skills training is limited to a fixed period during the students’ fourth year of study before the initiation of clinical practice training, the training design, in collaboration with SPs, is considered to have a significantly beneficial effect on students’ abilities (Noro, Abe, and Ban 2010), not only for science-based skills, but also for more humanistic clinical practice. In 2010, 43 out of 80 medical schools in Japan had trained their own SPs for their interview skills training (Shimura et al. 2011). Medical interview skills are complicated to acquire, a skillset that includes exhibiting empathy with consideration for patients’ social and mental backgrounds, while conducting an expertise-based collection of data on patients’ histories.

A more careful look at the textbooks reveals that explanations regarding empathic expressions mainly concern posture, gesture and the provision of clarifications, such as reflection and legitimation. These elements can be representative of a listening style. Such skills certainly create a supportive atmosphere and promote building rapport to achieve the goals of competence in medical students. However, there was a notable lack of encouragement to elicit patients’ statements and observe their verbal and non-verbal cues. Secondly, Noro et al.’s (2010) study showed that SPs are more engaged in small talk with female medical students; time spent on small talk and time constraints per each patient...
can be factors concerning contextual barriers that prevent male doctors from establishing a supportive environment. Analysis of potential contextual barriers, particularly attitudes and culturally based communication preferences, might shed further light on the discrepancy between education and practice.

As for cultural context, extant Japanese literature rarely reveals the nuances of ‘sympathy’ and ‘empathy’. However, because of the difficulties in engaging in a sustained discussion in which each of these words denotes different ideas, an important requirement is to determine precisely how empathy differs from sympathy. Umeda (2014) explains that when engaging in an in-depth examination of the word ‘empathy’ in any language, one should correctly grasp the precise nuances of the original terms ‘sympathy’ and ‘empathy’ and their uses in specific contexts. Saito (2000) distinguishes the Japanese term ‘empathy’ from ‘compassion’ and ‘support’ in clinical settings: ‘empathy’ can be achieved through a listening style using nods or repeating and paraphrasing to clarify what a patient is saying, and ‘compassion’ and ‘support’ are more emotional desires to ease patients’ sorrow and difficulties. The term ‘empathy’ varies greatly in the context of education. However, as a more advisable approach, the educational textbooks provide specific emphasis on eye contact, posture and displays of identification with patients’ feelings through attentive behaviours. These features correspond to attitudes that show understanding of patients’ predicaments.

Finally, although clear evidence of why Japanese doctors might not express empathy in consultations was not observed in the textbooks, empathic communication skills tied to listening styles were well described in the literature. A doctor’s empathy, as indirect expressions responding to patients’ needs in specific circumstances, can be further explored. In showing understanding, the doctor should pay special attention to whether the patient feels limited in telling stories. Social aspects, such as the time constraints per patient, are also inevitably factors that put doctors under great pressure. The importance of working with other professionals on a medical care team and participating in discussions with them were also described specifically in those educational guidelines.

5 Conclusions

The findings of this literature search have provided evidence that supports the promotion of clinical empathy in the Japanese medical education context. The evidence points to the following three outcomes: 1) clinical empathy as a concept in clinical communication remains reflective of Western conceptions, and uncertainty remains concerning the conceptualisation and definition in the Japanese context; 2) most explanations regarding attitudes/expressions, measured in response to patients’ emotional needs, included descriptions of posture, gestures and an output of clarifications, such as reflections and
justifications, and these were representative of the listening style; and 3) in the textbooks, there was a notable lack of doctors’ encouragement to elicit and address patients’ disclosure of information. Although this study has investigated widely-used textbooks in Japanese institutions, further investigations of clinical empathy in Japan would be worthwhile. This might include research in collaboration with clinical practitioners. The operational background of medical schools varies as well, according to doctors’ educational and cultural backgrounds. Theoretical education on clinical empathy and clinical communication is changing as healthcare systems evolve in many countries, including in Japan. It is also important to note that exploring empathy in different medical professions and healthcare institutions would elicit different insights in this area.

Further investigation on clinical empathy and its effectiveness will be required to conduct a well-designed study that widens the search parameters and includes several educational sources to explore how specific doctors’ responses relate to effective communication. From a social and cultural perspective, such studies about communication in healthcare settings will also need to include patients’ perspectives and expectations. Such further research will ultimately help medical students and professionals develop confidence and manage interactions with their patients and patients’ families.

References

Abe, K., K. Fujisaki, M. Niwa, and Y. Suzuki (2013). “Differences in Medical Students’ Emotional Intelligence and Empathy According to Academic Year and Sex”. In: Igaku Kyoiku (Medical Education) 44.5. In Japanese, pp. 315–326.


Clinical empathy in medical consultations in Japan


Noro, I., K. Abe, and N. Ban (2010). “Effects of Medical Student Gender on Communication during Objective Structured Clinical Examination Medical Interviews”. In: Medical Education 41.1. in Japanese, pp. 1–6.


(SP) and SP Program in Undergraduate Medical Education in Japan”. In: *Medical Education* 42.1. In Japanese, pp. 29–35.


**Kayo Kondo** is a PhD student in Language and Translation Research at the University of East Anglia, UK. Her current research is based on audio-recorded medical consultations between primary care physicians and older patients in Japan, focusing on verbal interactions. Her research draws on conversation analysis and face theories, which specifically highlights the verbal dimensions of Patient-Centred Communication as analytical aspects.